

#### CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

Council Chamber 455 North Rexford Drive Beverly Hills, CA 90210

# HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

February 3, 2017 9:00 a.m.

## **MEETING CALLED TO ORDER**

Date/Time:

February 3, 2017 / 9:03 a.m.

# PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Blumenfeld led the Pledge of Allegiance Chair Friedman read the Human Relations Commission's Civility Statement

## **ROLL CALL**

Commissioners Present:

Commissioners Popovich Levyn, Blumenfeld, Vice Chair Berman,

Chair Friedman

Commissioners Absent:

Saleh

Staff Present:

James R. Latta, Rachel L. Evans, Nestor Otazu, Nancy Hunt-

Coffey, Linda Kyriazi

Commissioner Saleh arrived at 9:05 a.m.

Vice Chair Berman read the following statement: "In the interest of transparency and to clear up any misinformation that is floating in this community, I want to put forth the following information: It is rumored that I am a property owner in Beverly Hills and therefore cannot be un-biased in these discussions. The only property I own in Beverly Hills is my personal residence. As a Trustee I manage a building. I have no financial interest in it; I have no financial gain from it. That has been vetted by the City Attorney. I do own property in other cities but my goal in these discussions is to make whatever rules and regulations come out of them to be fair and equitable for landlords and tenants. Thank you."

# Tab 1. HUMAN RELATIONS SPECIAL MEETING FOR THE COMMUNITY TO COME TOGETHER AND PROVIDE INPUT ON THE RENT STABILIZATION URGENCY

**ORDINANCE:** City Council charged the Human Relations Commission (HRC) to gather public feedback, compile the information and report back to Council on February 21, 2017 with their findings.

Human Services Administrator James R. Latta informed the Community that for those who could not attend today another Human Relations Commission meeting is being held on February 16, 2017 at 9am in City Hall.

The City Council charged the Human Relations Commission with the charge of gathering public feedback; compile the information and report back to Council at their meeting on February 21, 2017 at the 7pm Formal Meeting with their findings.

# Council Direction from the January 24, 2017 City Council Meeting:

- 1) Create a database for the approximately 8600 multi-family units (duplex and above)
- 2) Utilize database to establish a Rental Registry Program in the City of Beverly Hills.
- 3) Change the current No-Cause Termination ordinance in Beverly Hills to include relocation fees equal to City of Santa Monica
- 4) Reduce maximum annual rent increases from 10% to 3%

# Database:

- 1) Information is available through existing City systems
- 2) Staff is currently working to gather this information into one database

# Registry:

- 1) Registry annual update
- 2) Inspection Component (not determined)
  - Systematic Inspections of Inventory
  - Self-certification with checklist completed by landlord and tenant at the time the Tenant Landlord Rights and Responsibilities is signed
  - Complaint driven inspections (current)

#### Relocation fees:

- 1) Prior to the Urgency Ordinance, Chapter 5 relocation fees:
  - Bachelor Unit \$2,000, Single \$2,250, One or more bedrooms, \$3,000, Senior citizens terminally ill or handicapped \$5,000
- 2) Relocation fees were not available to Chapter 6 tenants.

#### New Relocation Fees:

Chapter 5 & 6 Relocation Fees:

Fee Amount	Fee if Tenant is a Senior Citizen
	(62+), Disabled or a minor.
\$9,050	\$10,350
\$13,900	\$16,000
\$18,850	\$21,650
()	\$9,050 \$13,900

Reduce maximum annual rent increases from 10% to 3%

# Public Input

From your perspective, do you support the changes in the Urgency Ordinance? If yes, why?
If no, why?

Human Relations Commission Special Meeting Minutes February 3, 2017

# To stay informed:

Visit: <a href="www.beverlyhills.org/living/rentstabilization">www.beverlyhills.org/living/rentstabilization</a>
Email: <a href="mailto:bHRentStabilization@beverlyhills.org">BHRentStabilization@beverlyhills.org</a>

## **COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE AUDIENCE**

Members of the public may address the Commission regarding any items not on the Agenda that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. By State law, the Commission may not discuss or vote on items not on the Agenda.

Speakers: Public input. There were 40 members of the community who provided their input on the current issues in the Urgency Ordinance. Of the 40 people providing feedback, 19 were landlords, 18 were tenants, and three were in neither category.

In total, 40 members of the community provided their input on the current issues in the Urgency Ordinance. Of the 40 people providing feedback, 19 were landlords, 18 were tenants and three were not in either category.

The numbers break down as follows:

There were 27 individuals who spoke to the Commission at the meeting.

- 16 were landlords
- 9 were tenants
- 2 did not fall in either category (urban planner and politician)

There were 12 emails sent in to be read at the Commission meeting.

- 8 were from tenants
- 3 were from landlords
- 1 was from an attorney who was neither a landlord nor a tenant

There was one Instagram post read at the meeting, written by a tenant.

In general, tenants greatly supported the Urgency Ordinance (3% rent increase cap and the addition of relocation fees when serving a no-cause termination notice), and landlords opposed it. Some of the common themes and comments are listed below.

## Tenants

- Continuing to receive very high/10% rent increases will force me to move out of the City
- I continue to receive 10% or very high rent increases annually, but improvements have never been made on my unit or the building
- Wage increases are much lower than the 10% rent increases renters will not be able to keep up
- States that they have been very long-time tenants, but are now being forced to move due to the high rent increases

- My building was just sold to a big corporation, and all the rents were raised 10%, but the necessary maintenance requests were not handled.
- No-cause terminations are unjust
- I fear retaliation from my landlord
- I live/moved here to send my children to BHUSD schools, and I will be forced to move if 10% rent increases will be allowed.
- Says that 55-60% of the students attending BHUSD schools are children of renter
- If the Urgency Ordinance is reversed, seniors and low-income tenants will not be protected, and it will affect their well-being.
- Relocation fees are fair to renters who receive a no-cause termination notice, and are a strong disincentive for landlords who engage in that practice
- This is a social issue that demands policy solutions

## Landlords

- States that the 3% cap will not allow landlords to make any necessary repairs requested by the tenant
- State that the 3% cap on rent increases will not allow landlords to make necessary capital improvements such as a new roof or new elevators.
- Instead of using a particular percentage as the maximum rent increase, a price index should be used instead, such as the CPI
- States that CPI is not an accurate tool to calculate maximum rent increases
- City water bill is very high if capping rent increases, the City should cap landlords' water bills
- States that no-cause terminations are an important tool for landlords to deal with nuisance tenants.
- States that most landlords do not issue very high/10% rent increases to their tenants
- States that the new codes should also apply to landlords who rent out their single family home.
- States that landlords who live in their duplex should be exempt from the new rent stabilization codes.
- States that landlords want to keep their tenants as long as possible since renting a unit to new tenants is an expensive and time consuming process
- Would like to be able to pass through capital improvement costs and other utility fees along to their tenants.
- Upset regarding the upcoming earthquake retrofit requirements
- Concerned about rental rates on the registry being public
- Chapter 5 units must only be for tenants' primary residences

Lastly, both parties mentioned that they did not have enough notice to prepare or come to the Special Commission meeting. Several tenants mentioned that due to the time of the meeting, many of their neighbors and peers who were also renters, were unable to attend.

Human Relations Commission Special Meeting Minutes February 3, 2017

# **ADJOURNMENT**

February 3, 2017 at 11:38 p.m.

PASSED AND APPROVED THIS 16 DAY of February, 2017

Jerald Friedman, Chair