



CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

455 North Rexford Drive
Beverly Hills, CA 90210
Video Teleconference

The Beverly Hills Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP) Community Advisory Committee

MEETING HIGHLIGHTS

Tuesday, November 30, 2021

2:00 PM

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

Date / Time: November 30, 2021 / 2:00 PM

IN ATTENDANCE:

CAAP Community Advisory Committee members Myra Lurie, Alissa Roston, Sharon Ignarro, Lisa Schwartz, Wendy Nystrom, Sharona Nazarian, Erica Felsenthal, Lee Hilborne, Myra Demeter, Peter Ostroff, Sandra Aronberg, Linda Newmark, Ariel Ouziel, Rene Jones, and Susan Kimura.

City Staff & Consultants: Director of Public Works Shana Epstein, Environmental Compliance and Sustainability Program Manager Josette Descalzo, Senior Management Analyst Melissa Gomez, Utilities General Manager Robert Welch, Civicspark Fellow Tory Brewster, Raimi Consultant Walker Wells, Raimi Consultant Sami Taylor, and Rincon Consultant Andrew Beecher

City Council: Council Member Julian A. Gold, M.D

COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE AUDIENCE

Members of the public were allowed to directly address the Committee on any item listed on the agenda.

Speakers: None

APPROVAL OF OCTOBER 19, 2021 HIGHLIGHTS

Item Was Not Discussed

- 1) A RESOLUTION OF THE CLIMATE ACTION AND ADAPTATION PLAN COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE OF THE CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS AUTHORIZING PUBLIC MEETINGS TO BE HELD VIA TELECONFERENCING PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54953(E) AND MAKING FINDINGS AND DETERMINATIONS REGARDING THE SAME**

Motion: MOVED by Sharona Nazarian, SECONDED by Lee Hilborne to approve the Resolution as presented (14/0).



CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

455 North Rexford Drive
Beverly Hills, CA 90210
Video Teleconference

AYES: All members of the Committee verbally approved the Resolution.

ABSTAIN: None

NOES: None

CARRIED

2) CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS INVOLVEMENT IN THE CLEAN POWER ALLIANCE

Council Member Julian A. Gold, M.D. presented information on the City's involvement with the Clean Power Alliance and upcoming discussions at the City Council. Council Member Gold serves as a Director for the Clean Power Alliance (CPA) Board.

Community Choice Aggregation

- Around 4-5 years ago, Community Choice Aggregation allowed communities to construct a network to buy greener energy than the energy provided by investor-owned utilities. This program is called the CPA.
- By law, once a City is admitted to the CPA:
 - Every member in the City defaults to the CPA clean energy level.
 - Members can always opt out of the CPA to Southern California Edison (SCE).
- When the City opted into the CPA, the City had to select the amount of green energy to incorporate. The options included:
 - Lean - 36% green energy
 - Clean - 50% green energy
 - Green - 100% green energy
- When the City first joined the CPA, each level of green energy had an associated price impact.
 - The CPA tied the rate structure to SCE.
 - Lean would be cheaper than the SCE rate.
 - Clean would be approximately the same rate as the SCE rate.
 - Green would be a little more expensive than the SCE rate.
- The CPA currently partners with 30 cities and the unincorporated areas of Ventura and Los Angeles counties, serves over a million customers, and procures approximately one billion dollars worth of energy.
- CPA members have an opportunity to change its default energy product (rate) annually and take into effect by October of the following year.
 - Homeowners and business owners can elect to adjust their energy product (rate) higher or lower than a defaulted rate set by the member agency.
- If the City of Beverly Hills changes the default rate to 100% renewable energy:
 - Every CPA customer in the City will be defaulted to 100% renewable energy; Customers who are currently enrolled in 100% Green Power or at 40% Lean Power will not be affected by this change. Homeowners and businesses who



CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

455 North Rexford Drive
Beverly Hills, CA 90210
Video Teleconference

prefer to have more savings can opt down into the 50% Clean Power or 40% Lean Power rates.

- Regardless of procurement, all transmission lines are managed by SCE. Therefore, all energy, regardless of procurement, is transmitted by SCE. The only entity with control over SCE transmission rates is the Public Utilities Commission.
- The financial impact for the City to opt into 100% renewable energy:
 - Most of the City's energy bills will increase by 2-3%
- Recommendation from Council Member Gold:
 - It is time to adjust the City's rate to 100% renewable energy to honor the City's commitment to sustainability. Individuals can adjust rates as needed.

Questions from the Committee

- What is the reason that clean energy is more expensive than the alternative?
 - While the price of clean energy has gone down, several reasons contribute to green energy being more expensive than the alternative:
 - Renewable energy infrastructure is in its early stages. Infrastructure costs are very expensive, and construction for renewable energy infrastructure is just starting to increase.
 - There are rules that cap the amount of energy purchased from out-of-state providers. Buying energy from out of state would decrease clean energy costs.
 - The CPA is paying a premium for the development of wind and solar energy and expanding battery storage. However, expanding battery storage is expensive.
- Is there decreased reliability if the City opts into 100%?
 - The CPA buys electricity based on expected demand.
 - If demand is higher than expected, the CPA will substitute energy sources with non-renewable energy.
- Homeowners are experiencing too many power outages and substituting for gas-powered generators. Will the reliability issues worsen if we increase rates?
 - SCE is responsible for the transmission of energy.
 - Right now, it would cost too much for the CPA to transmit energy or update it. However, the CPA can pressure SCE to work on transmission issues.
 - A green solution to blackouts would be to place solar panels with a battery backup system on South facing buildings/residences.
- When will community members see an increase in the rates if the City moves forward with 100% renewable energy?
 - After the first billing cycle in October, residents would not see an increase until next fall.

Comments from the Committee

- There needs to be more education on how homeowners can change their rates because the current process is complicated.



CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

455 North Rexford Drive
Beverly Hills, CA 90210
Video Teleconference

- Committee members were asked if any of them oppose the City opting to 100% Green Power. No members opposed.

3) BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON THE CITY'S SUSTAINABLE POLICIES AND PROGRAMS

Item Was Not Discussed

4) GHG EMISSIONS BASELINE, INVENTORY, AND FORECAST

Co-Chair Ostroff encouraged members of the Committee to review the agenda packet with information on the Public Works Department's sustainability projects, accomplishments, and data on the City's greenhouse gas emissions.

Questions from the Committee

- To what extent does the current baseline reflect all of the programs that the City implemented?
 - The City's current baseline reflects all of the City's programs.
- Are any other Climate Action and Adaptation Plans (CAAP) a good template for us?
 - Santa Monica has the more aggressive and updated CAAP.
- What kind of budget does the City have that can be directed towards this CAAP apart from the City's capital improvement plan?
 - The CAC recommendations regarding targets set by the City for the CAAP will determine the price of the associated policy measures.
 - Policies will affect the budget, so the City will not know an estimation yet, but the goal is to set recommendations for policies that get implemented.

5) EMISSIONS GOALS AND TIME FRAMES

Item Was Not Discussed

6) MEASURES TO ACHIEVE REDUCTIONS

Item Was Not Discussed

7) COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

Item Was Not Discussed

8) SETTING THE NEXT MEETING DATE



CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

455 North Rexford Drive
Beverly Hills, CA 90210
Video Teleconference

Staff informed the Committee that the next meeting date would be coordinated with local television, and staff will collect availability information by email.

9) CHAIR'S REPORT

Co-chair's Wendy Nystrom and Peter Ostroff requested ad-hoc preferences from members of the Committee. Committee members took turns talking about sectors each member were interested in discussing.

10) DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Item Was Not Discussed

ADJOURNMENT

Date / Time:

November 30, 2021/ 4:16 PM