

## **Appendix D - Review of Past Accomplishments (2006-2014)**

---

A. Housing Production and RHNA Allocation .....	D-2
1. Multi-Family Housing .....	D-2
2. Single-Family Housing .....	D-2
B. Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014) .....	D-5

The City of Beverly Hills is committed to continually improving programs in the Housing Element to ensure that the housing needs of the community are met. Reviewing past accomplishments is an important step in developing housing strategies that are effective and address identified community needs. State law requires the City to report on progress made in meeting the goals, policies, and objectives set forth in the prior Housing Element. This includes reviewing progress made in implementing programs included in the adopted element, and evaluating their effectiveness and continued appropriateness for the City. The State also requires the City to report on the housing production during the prior Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) period.

The last Housing Element was adopted in 2011 and covered the RHNA period from January 1, 2006 to June 30, 2014. The following section provides information on housing production since 2006 and an update on the implementation of programs set forth in the 2008-2014 Housing Element.

## **A. Housing Production and RHNA Allocation**

---

The City's 2006-2014 RHNA allocation is 554 units. This includes the 436 units assigned to the City in the Final Regional Housing Needs Allocation Plan for the planning period of January 1, 2006 to June 30, 2014 as well as the carry-over units from the prior RHNA. Between January 1, 2006 and April 1, 2013, 576 total housing units were constructed in the City of Beverly Hills. During the same period, 289 units were demolished or converted, resulting in a net gain of 287 units.

### **1. Multi-Family Housing**

---

Between January 1, 2006, and April 1, 2013, 262 net multi-family units were completed, per information compiled by the Community Development Department. The majority of units built were condominium units that were affordable to above-moderate-income households.

#### ***Second Units***

During the RHNA period, 20 second units were built. In 2010, the City completed a survey of second units to determine the prevalence and affordability of these units in the City. Responses indicated that more than eighty-one percent of the inhabited second units in the City were offered for little or no rent, or "very low" rent levels. Three percent of the units were rented at "low" rent levels, and twelve percent of the occupied units were rented at "moderate" levels. Therefore, the City is able to count eighty-one percent of the second units built, or 16 units, as meeting housing needs of the very low income population, three percent, or one unit, as meeting the needs of the low income population, and twelve percent, or two units, as meeting the needs of the moderate income population. The remainder of the second units built, one unit, will be counted as above moderate housing.

### **2. Single-Family Housing**

---

The City's database shows that 6 net new single-family homes were constructed between January 1, 2006 and April 1, 2013. These homes were located throughout the community and were affordable to above-moderate-income households.

#### ***Total Units***

Table D-1 summarizes the net units completed between January 1, 2006 and April 1, 2013. Units were considered completed if they had finalized building permits. The RHNA Allocation for this time period is also presented in the table for comparison.

<b>Table D-1 Units Completed and RHNA Allocation January 1, 2006 to April 1, 2013</b>					
Data as of April 1, 2013	<b>Number of Units</b>	Very Low	Low (51-80%)	Moderate (81-120%)	Above Moderate
Single Family Net	<b>6</b>				6
Second Units Net	<b>20</b>	16	1	2	1
Multi-Family Net	<b>262</b>				262
<b>Total Units</b>	<b>288</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>269</b>
RHNA Allocation	<b>554</b>	146	113	117	178

SOURCE: City of Beverly Hills Community Development Department, 2013

The City also maintains data on housing units entitled but not yet built. The number and type of housing entitled during a planning period can illustrate the success of efforts to remove government constraints for housing development. A total of 827 units were completed and entitled from January 1, 2006 to April 1, 2013 (Table D-2, [Units Completed and Entitled and RHNA Allocation January 1, 2006 to April 1, 2013]).

<b>Table D-2 Units Completed and Entitled and RHNA Allocation January 1, 2006 to April 1, 2013</b>					
Data as of April 1, 2013	Number of Units	Very Low	Low (51-80%)	Moderate (81-120%)	Above Moderate
Completed Units	288	16	0	2	269
Entitled Units	539	0	3	4	532
RHNA Allocation	554	146	113	117	178

SOURCE: City of Beverly Hills Community Development Department, 2013

In the 2008-2014 Housing Element, the City set forth the following specific objectives for housing production to meet the fair share planning targets set by SCAG (Table B-3, [2008-2014 Summary of Quantified Objectives]).

<b>Table D-3 2008-2014 Summary of Quantified Objectives</b>			
Income Group	<b>New Construction Objective (Actual)</b>	<b>Rehabilitation Objective (Actual)</b>	<b>Conservation Objective (Actual)</b>
Extremely Low	73 (0)		75 (75)
Very Low	73 (16)	110 (123)	75 (75)
Low	113 (1)	110 (16)	
Moderate	117 (2)		
Above Moderate	178 (269)		

<b>Table D-3 2008-2014 Summary of Quantified Objectives</b>			
<b>Income Group</b>	<b>New Construction Objective (Actual)</b>	<b>Rehabilitation Objective (Actual)</b>	<b>Conservation Objective (Actual)</b>
<i>Total</i>	<i>554</i> <i>(287)</i>	<i>220</i> <i>(139)</i>	<i>150</i> <i>(150)</i>

Rehabilitation of the existing housing stock helps preserve the quality of neighborhoods and housing. The City continues to fund the Handyworker program, which provides rehabilitation assistance to low-income tenants and homeowners in the City. Approximately 135 households were served by this program in the last planning period.

The 150-unit Beverly Hills Senior Housing project provides affordable housing to very low-income senior/handicapped residents. The City works with the nonprofit Menorah Housing to ensure the conservation of these units.

Table D-4 summarizes additional accomplishments the City has made in achieving housing programs and goals.

...

**B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)**

**Program**

**Progress/Appropriateness**

*Prior Goal 1:* Maintain and enhance the quality and character of existing housing and residential neighborhoods.

**Program 9.1 Upkeep and maintenance of vacated buildings**

Continue to require the exterior of vacated multi-family structures that will be demolished for redevelopment to be adequately maintained as a condition of tentative map approvals and extensions.

Continue to maintain a list of all vacant properties in the City, monitor the sites, and work with the property owners to assure that the properties are maintained in an appropriate manner.

**Progress:** The City continues to implement this program. The City’s Community Preservation Division maintains a list of vacant buildings and properties and works with property owners to ensure they are maintained.

**Appropriateness:** This program is effective in maintaining vacant properties in an appropriate manner. It remains appropriate and is included in the Element.

**Program 9.2 Property Maintenance** Continue to require housing to be maintained in an aesthetic, safe and habitable manner consistent with City codes. Explore restructuring the current Code Enforcement program to include a random housing inspection program.

**Progress:** The City continues to implement this program. Between 2008 and 2013 the City received an average of 360 property maintenance complaints annually. The City is currently exploring the restructure of the Code Enforcement program and has yet to determine if a random housing inspection program would be beneficial.

**Appropriateness:** This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.

**Program 9.4 Home Repair and Improvement** Continue the Handyworker Program to provide minor home repair and improved security and mobility assistance to low income tenants and homeowners in single and multi-family units. This program serves extremely low, very-low and low-income households. Serve a target of 40 low income households per year or 220 over the planning period.

**Progress:** the City continues to fund the Handyworker Program. For the period between January 1, 2008, and March 2013, the total number of households served by the Handyworker Program was 139.

**Appropriateness:** This program provides a valuable service to extremely low, very-low and low-income households in the City. This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.

**Program 9.5 Condominium Conversion** Evaluate the effectiveness of the existing condominium conversion regulations (BHMC 10-2-710, 711, and 712) that set forth a series of tenant protections including tenant noticing, relocation provisions, right of first purchase, extended lease provisions for senior and disabled households and set an annual limit on the number of conversions allowed.

Consider modifying the ordinance to require a number of units in any building converted to be set aside as affordable rental or ownership housing. Evaluate the benefit of offering an in-lieu fee option that would go into the City’s Housing Trust Fund and be used to provide affordable housing in the City.

**Progress:** The City’s current ordinance was evaluated in 2011 and a determination was made that existing tenant protections were sufficient and consistent with state law. The City has not had any recent condominium conversion requests and thus setting an annual cap on the number of conversions is not deemed necessary.

**Appropriateness:** Tenant protections under the condominium conversion ordinance will remain in place. When the City moves forward with a nexus study in support of an inclusionary housing ordinance, extension of inclusionary requirements and in-lieu fee options to condo conversions will also be evaluated. A separate program in the Housing Element is no longer necessary.

## B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)

Program	Progress/Appropriateness
<p><b>Program 9.6 Rent Stabilization</b> Continue the City's rent stabilization ordinance, which limits annual rent increases and provides tenant protections, to investigate tenant complaints regarding unlawful rent increases, service reductions, evictions and relocations. Investigate a target of 30 complaints per year.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City continued to implement the current program. Approximately 24 complaints were received and investigated each year. Between 2008 and 2013, the City received approximately 650 rent stabilization related inquiries by phone, email or in person annually.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This provides support for tenants and helps regulate rent increases. It remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Program 9.7 Monitoring Affordable Housing</b> Continue to coordinate with the service provider of the assisted housing project that provides 150 units of affordable rental housing to very low income seniors. This coordination includes monitoring Section 8 renewals, advising tenants in advance of any potential conversion dates, and providing opportunities to continue affordability covenants.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City continues to implement this program. The one very-low income building in the City has an affordability covenant and 150 units available to very low income seniors. The City contracts with Menorah Housing Foundation to oversee and administer the units.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Prior Goal 2:</b> Provide a variety of housing types and adequate affordable housing supply to meet the existing and future needs of the community.</p>	
<p><b>Program 10.1 Density Bonus</b> The City will modify the current ordinance to include specific lists of options in order to provide greater certainty in the type of development incentives and concessions that could be requested by developers applying for a density bonus.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City is in the process of studying incentives that will be included in a list of options for developers. A program establishing a specific list of incentive options is expected to be adopted in 2013.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program will be effective in establishing an ordinance to provide greater certainty in the type of development incentives available for developers receiving a density bonus. The City will continue to work with developers using the density bonus.</p>
<p><b>Program 10.2 Inclusionary Housing</b> Conduct an inclusionary housing nexus study to document the relationship between residential development and demand for affordable housing, and to determine both the maximum supportable and recommended in-lieu fee amount. Pursue adoption of an inclusionary housing program to require a minimum percent of units in development to be price-restricted as affordable to lower and moderate income households. The ordinance will require either: (a) provision of affordable housing onsite; (b) provision of affordable units off-site; or (c) payment of an affordable housing in-lieu fee. In lieu fees generated from the program will be contributed to the City's Housing Trust Fund.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City has not yet initiated a nexus study, but is planning to do so in the near future.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> The City will continue to move forward with a nexus study and the adoption of an inclusionary housing program. This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>

**B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)**

Program	Progress/Appropriateness
<p><b>Program 10.3 Housing Trust Fund</b> Establish a Housing Trust Fund that will be used to construct or help leverage construction of affordable housing. Establish an Affordable Housing Program to manage the Trust Fund and establish parameters for allocation of funds towards projects, including consideration of priority assistance to projects that include a portion of units affordable to extremely low income households.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> Through development agreements, the City has negotiated approximately \$3 Million dollars to be used to establish a housing trust fund. The three projects have not been built to date; however, once the City receives the money this will establish the trust fund. Parameters for the use of money in the trust fund will be established at that time. The City has linked the housing trust fund with the in-lieu fees in Program 10.2.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Program 10.4 Second Units</b> In order to further encourage the provision of second units, the City will evaluate modifications to its second unit ordinance including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Greater flexibility in second unit standards in R-1 zones south of Santa Monica Boulevard</li> <li>▪ Allowances for larger sized second units, of up to 1,000 square feet by right to reduce processing times, and facilitate the provision of second units with bedrooms.</li> <li>▪ For second units built above a garage, allowance for an increase in the permitted height up to the height of the primary residence.</li> <li>▪ Allowances for reduced setback requirements where privacy is not compromised.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Progress:</b> A second unit study was conducted in 2010 and the results were discussed in the 2008-2014 Housing Element. The City is currently studying changes to the ordinance that could further incentivize the development of second units south of Santa Monica Boulevard. A second unit brochure has been created and is available to the public at the permit counter, public library, community centers, and online. This brochure describes what a second unit is, and explains the process for permitting and building a second unit in the City.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> The City will continue to evaluate modifications to its second unit ordinance in order to encourage the provision of more second units in the City. This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p>Develop a brochure to provide information on the City's second unit standards, and promote their development.</p>	
<p><b>Program 10.5 Affordable Housing Production Brochure</b> Develop a brochure to summarize available incentives offered for the development of affordable housing, including fee waivers, density bonuses, modified standards for senior and disabled housing and development standards. Provide a series of web pages and downloadable handouts. Provide brochures in the permit center, and other public information areas.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City developed two housing brochures. One summarizes incentives and standards for affordable housing. The second provides information on current housing programs to people in need of affordable housing and related services. The brochure is provided at the permit center, library, and community center. The information is also included on the City's newly created Housing website.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program has been accomplished. The City will continue to provide the brochures to the public and update them as appropriate; however a separate program is no longer necessary.</p>
<p><b>Program 10.6 Sustainability and Green Building</b> Continue the green building program and waive compliance with the program if it would frustrate the ability to provide affordable</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City continues to implement the current program in consistency with the State's CalGreen building code.</p>

## B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)

Program	Progress/Appropriateness
housing in a project.	<b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.
<p><b>Program 10.7 Partnerships with Affordable Housing Developers</b> Initiate a partnership and continue to work with non-profit developers to assist in the development of housing affordable to extremely low and lower income households. The City will annually invite non-profit developers to discuss the City's plans, resources, site development opportunities and RFQ process. Select a non-profit developer to develop an affordable housing project, and support this effort through leveraging local Housing Trust Funds, assisting in the application for State and federal financial resources, facilitating project entitlement and providing a package of incentives.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City prepared and scheduled a meeting with developers and affordable housing managers, which was held on February 7, 2013. Attendees were provided information on the City's housing incentives, and asked to complete a comment card on perceived barriers to developing affordable housing in the City, as well as things that the City could do to address these barriers. This meeting was a first step in establishing partnerships with affordable housing developers in anticipation for future affordable housing funds (Program 10.3).</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> The City will continue to work with non-profit developers and hold an annual forum to discuss affordable housing plans, resources, and development. This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Prior Goal 3 Fair Housing and Special Needs Residents:</b> Promote equal housing opportunities for all residents; including Beverly Hills' special needs populations, so residents have a choice of appropriate housing.</p>	
<p><b>Program 11.1 Fair Housing Program</b> Continue to promote fair housing practices, and refer fair housing complaints to the Housing Rights Center, which provides fair housing investigation and coordinates referral services to assist individuals who may have been the victims of discrimination. Advertise the fair housing program through placement of fair housing services brochures at public counters in City Hall and the Library, at the Beverly Hills Senior Center, and on the City's website.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City provides information about the Housing Rights Center and Fair Housing services on the City website (<a href="http://www.beverlyhills.org">www.beverlyhills.org</a>) and in the brochures created under Program 10.5.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Program 11.2 Senior Housing Development:</b> Actively pursue development of an affordable housing project targeted towards Beverly Hills' extremely low and lower income residents. The City will provide the incentives outlined in prior program 10.7 (Partnerships with Affordable Housing Developers) to facilitate development.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> This program commenced with an open house to initiate a dialogue with the affordable housing development community (refer to program 10.7). The City is also in the process of specifying development incentives as part of the update to its density bonus ordinance. Once the Affordable Housing Trust Fund is funded, the City will be able to more actively move forward in pursuing development of an affordable senior project.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Program 11.3 Senior Case Management Program</b> Continue to contract with Jewish Family Services to provide a comprehensive case management program to assist frail elderly residents to remain independent and in their homes.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City has continued to provide funding to Jewish Family Services, which provides a broad range of support services to seniors living independently. As of 2012, the program had served approximately 250 clients. A number of additional programs provide assistance to seniors including: the Beverly Hills Active Club, which provides</p>



## B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)

Program	Progress/Appropriateness
	exercise classes and activities at La Cienega and Roxbury Parks, the Senior Center and Senior Library at Roxbury Park (funded through the City Library).
	<b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element
<b>Program 11.4 Senior Homesharing Program</b> Evaluate Community Assistance Funds and determine grant amount annually for support of the shared housing program administered by Alternative Living for the Aging (ALA).	<b>Progress:</b> Due to competing requests for funds, this program was not funded in Fiscal Year 2012/2013. The City will continue to evaluate available funds and consider refunding the program in the future
	<b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.
<b>Program 11.5 Accessible Housing</b> Develop and adopt written procedures for reasonable accommodation requests with respect to zoning laws, permit processing, and building laws. Procedures will specify who may request an accommodation, time frames for decisions making and specific modification provisions. City will inform and educate the public on the process of requesting an accommodation.	<b>Progress:</b> On December 4, 2012, the City Council adopted ordinance 12-O-2634 adding Article 36.7 "Reasonable Accommodation Procedures for Disabled Persons" to Chapter 3 of Title 10 of the Beverly Hills Municipal Code. This article establishes a procedure for Disabled Persons, or their representatives, to request a reasonable accommodation from the City's zoning laws, building codes, and land use regulations, polices, and procedures to provide Disabled Persons with an opportunity to use and enjoy housing equal to that of non-disabled persons.
	<b>Appropriateness:</b> This program has been accomplished. The City will continue to implement and promote the Reasonable Accommodation Procedures, however a separate program is no longer necessary.
<b>Program 11.6 Funding for Homeless Services</b> Continue the CLASP (Changing Lives and Sharing Places) Program to provide street outreach workers and homeless case management. Continue to provide approximately 1,000 shelter bed nights per year through People Assisting The Homeless (PATH). Fund a variety of service organizations that serve the homeless through the Community Assistance Grant Program. Organizations include the All Saints Homeless Assistance Program, the Westside Food Bank, the Lost Angeles Free Clinic and the Maple Mental Health Counseling Center.	<b>Progress:</b> The City has continued to fund All Saints Homeless Assistance Program, Jewish Family Services, The Maple Counseling Center, People Assisting the Homeless (PATH), the Saban Free Clinic (previously the Los Angeles Free Clinic), and the Westside Food Bank. In 2012/13 funding was increased for the Changing Lives and Sharing Places (CLASP) program. The HOST program, which provides outreach to homeless persons, operated by Step Up On Second was also funded for the first time. The City also provides section 8 vouchers to PATH and Step Up on Second to be used for longer-term housing for homeless persons. In the 2011-2012 fiscal year, the City purchased an apartment unit in a supportive housing project constructed by Step Up on Second in Los Angeles with the intent that the unit will provide permanent supporting housing to a person formerly homeless in Beverly Hills.
	<b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element

## B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)

Program	Progress/Appropriateness
<p><i>Prior Goal 4</i> Constraints: Mitigate potential governmental constraints on the maintenance, improvement and development of housing, while maintaining community character.</p>	
<p><b>Program 12.1 Zoning Text Amendment for Special Needs Housing</b> Amend the zoning code in 2012 to make explicit provisions for a variety of special needs housing. This includes developing written objective standards for emergency shelters as permitted under SB 2.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> On November 23, 2012, the City adopted Ordinance 12-O-2633 establishing definitions, designating use, and adopting local planning and approval requirements for emergency shelters, supportive housing, community care facilities and single room occupancy units. This ordinance is consistent with housing element program 12.1 and consistent with State regulations.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program has been accomplished. The City will continue to implement actions outlined in the ordinance; however, a separate program is no longer necessary.</p>
<p><b>Program 12.2 Adjust Development Standards</b> The City will reduce its minimum unit size requirements, and will conduct an analysis of its multi-family development standards and establish measurable parameters to assess which other standards serve as an actual constraint to development of housing for a range of housing types. For the standards identified as a constraint, the City will implement revisions to mitigate, including, but not limited to an evaluation of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Replacing current density calculation for multi-family projects in the zoning code with a maximum floor area ratio</li> <li>▪ Modifying development standards for single-lot projects</li> <li>▪ Allowing greater flexibility in the type, and location of multi-family parking</li> <li>▪ Allowing the same number of units to be rebuilt on properties that have more units than currently would be allowed</li> <li>▪ Providing additional incentives for workforce housing over and above those contained in the provisions of the State Density Bonus</li> </ul>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City is conducting a study to understand what incentives, concessions and waivers would be most beneficial to building affordable housing in the City. This study is intended to inform upcoming modifications to the city’s multi-family development standards in 2013. The City is also currently exploring minimum unit sizes for multi-family residential units that would be comparable to surrounding cities.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>

**B. Table D-4 Housing Program Accomplishments (2008 – 2014)**

Program	Progress/Appropriateness
<p><b>Program 12.3 Reduced Fees for Affordable Housing</b> Evaluate the economic benefit of providing waivers or reductions of certain taxes and fees including certain project fees for developments containing very low, low- and moderate-income housing units, as well as for housing developed under the City’s modified standards for Multiple-family Residences for the Elderly and Handicapped Persons (Deed Restricted). The City will conduct fee study in 2012 and adopt modified development fees for affordable housing.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City is currently studying fee reductions that would be meaningful to local affordable housing builders. The study is expected to be finalized in 2013.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>
<p><b>Program 12.4 Monitor the Development Review Process</b> Members of the Development Review Taskforce will review the City’s development review processes, identify inefficiencies and uncertainties in the City’s review, and promote alternative techniques intended to streamline the process and to add greater levels of certainty in the development review process. Evaluate the development review process for housing projects on a project-level basis to identify, and to the extent possible, reduce any potential points of uncertainty in the process. Procedures will be modified as appropriate within one year.</p>	<p><b>Progress:</b> The City recently hired an Urban Designer to help streamline review of new housing projects and other development proposed in the City. Additionally, in an effort to streamline permitting, the Community Development Department was restructured to form a dedicated group of zoning code and building experts focused on processing permits. The City is currently updating its zoning code to reduce inefficiencies and uncertainty in the development process. This zoning update is also intended to streamline the development review process and is expected to be completed by early 2014.</p> <p><b>Appropriateness:</b> This program remains appropriate and is included in the Element.</p>

...