Beverly Hills City Council Liaison / Audit and Finance Committee will conduct a Special Meeting, at the following time and place, and will address the agenda listed below:

CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS
455 N. Rexford Drive
Beverly Hills, CA 90210

TELEPHONIC VIDEO CONFERENCE MEETING

Beverly Hills Liaison Meeting
https://www.gotomeet.me/BHLiaison
No password needed
You can also dial in by phone:
United States (Toll Free): 1-866-899-4679 or United States: +1 646-749-3117
Access Code: 660-810-077

Friday, January 8, 2021
2:00 PM

Pursuant to Executive Order N-25-20, members of the Beverly Hills City Council and staff may participate in this meeting via a teleconference. In the interest of maintaining appropriate social distancing, members of the public can view this meeting through live webcast at www.beverlyhills.org/live and on BH Channel 35 on Spectrum Cable, and can participate in the teleconference/video conference by using the link above. Written comments may be emailed to mayorandcitycouncil@beverlyhills.org.

AGENDA

1) Public Comment
   a. Members of the public will be given the opportunity to directly address the Committee on any item listed on the agenda.

2) Performance Audit of Innovation and the City’s Transition into the 21st Century

3) Update on the Office of the City Auditor Audit Work Plan FY 20/21

4) Adjournment

Huma Ahmed
City Clerk

Posted: January 6, 2021

A DETAILED LIAISON AGENDA PACKET IS AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT WWW.BEVERLYHILLS.ORG

Pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, the City of Beverly Hills will make reasonable efforts to accommodate persons with disabilities. If you require special assistance, please call (310) 285-1014 (voice) or (310) 285-6881 (TTY). Providing at least twenty-four (24) hours advance notice will help to ensure availability of services.
December 30, 2020

Honorable Mayor and City Council
City of Beverly Hills, California

Transmitted herewith is the Performance Audit of Innovation and the City’s Transition into 21st Century Government. While this audit does not include formal recommendations, it does provide insight into areas for consideration in the City’s strategic planning efforts as it relates to information technology, maximizing the existing workforce, and the use of remote working options beyond the pandemic.

We would like to thank management and staff within the Human Resources (HR), Finance, and Information Technology (IT) Departments for their assistance. We briefed City Management, HR Management, and IT Management on our observations. The briefing memos can be found on our website. We would also like to thank survey respondents from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units for participating in our survey. The audit staff responsible for this report are Shawnee’ Pickney and Evelin Garcia.

Respectfully submitted,

Eduardo Luna
City Auditor

cc: George Chavez, City Manager
Nancy Hunt-Coffey, Assistant City Manager
Gabriella Yap, Deputy City Manager
Laurence Wiener, City Attorney
Shelly Ovrom, Director, Human Resources
Kirsten Rowe, Assistant Director of Human Resources
Michael Nettles, Manager, Human Resources
Sharon L’Heuruex Dressel, Risk Manager, Human Resources
Jeff Muir, Director, Finance Department
Tatiana Szerwinski, Assistant Director, Finance Department
David Schirmer, Chief Information Officer, Information Technology Department
Mark Hobson, Assistant Chief Information Officer, Information Technology Department
Purpose

• The Office of the City Auditor (OCA) conducted a survey to obtain staff feedback about their:
  – Telework experience
  – Ideas for innovation in their respective departments’ operations

• Survey provides baseline of employee sentiments for future evaluations of telework program if instituted

• Survey results identify areas for management consideration related to strategic planning around technological infrastructure, policies and procedures for remote working, and ideas for operational improvements within the City
Scope and Methodology

Scope

• Teleworking employees within the following bargaining units:
  – Confidential
  – Management and Professional (M&P)
  – Municipal Employees Association (MEA)

Methodology

• Surveyed each group between October 22, 2020 and December 1, 2020
  – Questions for the Survey can be found in Appendix I: Survey Questions
We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.
Background


- Pandemic mitigation strategies from federal, state, and local authorities resulted in:
  - Implementation of stay-at-home orders
  - Limited in-person contact
    - E.g. virtual environment, 6-foot distance, etc.
  - Other virus mitigation strategies
    - E.g. hygiene advisements (handwashing, etc.), face coverings, etc.

- Beverly Hills City Manager directed departments to implement telework based on position suitability.
### COVID Statistics Between 11/9/2020 and 12/18/2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Nov 9th</th>
<th>Dec 18th</th>
<th>% Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>50.7M</td>
<td>75.4M</td>
<td>49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaths</td>
<td>1.3M</td>
<td>1.7M</td>
<td>33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>10M</td>
<td>17.4M</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaths</td>
<td>238K</td>
<td>313K</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>965K</td>
<td>1.7M</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaths</td>
<td>18K</td>
<td>22K</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>322K</td>
<td>580K</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaths</td>
<td>7.2K</td>
<td>8.7K</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>808</td>
<td>1.3K</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaths</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: OCA generated based on data from the John Hopkins Coronavirus Resource Center, the California Department of Public Health, and the County of Los Angeles Department of Public Health. Data reflective of snapshots taken on December 18, 2020.
Projected Daily Infections and Death Estimates for the U.S. for 12/31/2020

**Terminology**

- **Mandates Easing:** Continued easing of social distancing mandates and mandates not re-imposed
- **Rapid Rollout:** Vaccine distribution is scaled up over 45 days
- **Current Projection:** Mandates re-imposed for six weeks whenever daily deaths reach 8 per million
- **Universal Masks:** 95 percent mask usage in public in every location with mandates re-imposed for six weeks if daily deaths reach 8 per million

Projected Daily Infections and Death Estimates for the California for 12/31/2020

Terminology

- Mandates Easing: Continued easing of social distancing mandates and mandates not re-imposed
- Rapid Rollout: Vaccine distribution is scaled up over 45 days
- Current Projection: Mandates re-imposed for six weeks whenever daily deaths reach 8 per million
- Universal Masks: 95 percent mask usage in public in every location with mandates re-imposed for six weeks if daily deaths reach 8 per million

COVID-19 cases continue to accumulate

Indicates the need for continued:
- Social distancing
- Diligence in hygiene practices (e.g. hand washing, etc.)
- Cleaning and disinfecting frequently used surfaces
- Mask wearing to protect self and others
- Adherence to best practices and compliance with science-based advisements and directives

Pandemic fatigue and other behaviors may impact individual and collective compliance
Pandemic Fatigue and Behavior

• Pandemic fatigue includes:
  – Feeling mentally and physically exhausted
  – Inability to start and perform everyday activities
  – Experiencing difficulty with thinking clearly and concentrating on work

• Other pandemic behavior
  – Underestimating the possibility and impact of a disaster, resulting in inadequate preparation
  – Choosing short-term rewards at the expense of future benefits
• Various perspectives exist regarding approaches to mitigating the pandemic
  – For example, people may take an optimistic, moderate, or pessimistic approach when strategizing

• Fundamentally, City will need to continue and/or develop:
  – Virtual Interactions (between employees and with the public)
  – Touchless Commerce (online mediums, phone applications, etc.)
  – Teleworking (based on position suitability, established criteria, etc.)

  – OCA completed a behavioral risk assessment that can be found in Appendix II: COVID-19 Behavioral Risk Assessment
Opportunity to Evaluate City Operations

- Pandemic creates an internal case study to evaluate the City’s capacity to:
  - Operate virtually
  - Innovate
  - Prepare for 21st Century governance
  - Meet its Sustainability Goals

- Beverly Hills Sustainable City Plan goals include:
  - Maximizing energy efficiency in both City operations and citywide
  - Reducing traffic congestion while improving pedestrian experiences
  - Encouraging equitable and fair access to City services and facilities for all members of the community
Survey Respondent Demographics

**Confidential**
- Total Respondents = 16
- Survey Universe = 19
- Response Rate = 84%

**M&P**
- Total Respondents = 86
- Survey Universe = 114
- Response Rate = 75%

**MEA**
- Total Respondents = 45
- Survey Universe = 66
- Response Rate = 68%

**All Surveyed Bargaining Units**
- Total Respondents = 147
- Survey Universe = 199
- Response Rate = 74%
SurveyRespondent Demographics

- Respondents represent employees within City departments except the Police and Fire departments
- Respondents include supervisors and managers, customer service staff, analysts, and other positions
- Almost 60 percent of respondents have been in their positions for 1-5 years
- Approximately 20 percent of respondents have been employed with the City for more than 10 years

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units' survey results.
Survey Respondent Demographics

- Geographically, respondents live in areas that extend farther than 20 miles south, 30 miles east, 16 miles north, and 10 miles west of Beverly Hills.

- 2019 Census Data estimated that approximately 21 percent of commuters who drive alone and 59 percent of commuters who take public transportation have a commute time of 45 minutes to more than an hour.

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units' survey results.
2018, 2019, and 2020 City Average Vehicle Ridership

- 2020 was the first year that Beverly Hills observed and recorded telecommuting in the Average Vehicle Ridership (AVR) Study.
- City 2018, 2019, and 2020 AVR studies show that driving alone and telecommuting percentages are closer in comparison in 2020.
- The shift has occurred while City continues providing services, with few exceptions, offered pre-pandemic.

Source: OCA generated based on data from the 2018, 2019, and 2020 City of Beverly Hills Average Vehicle Ridership Studies.
An analysis of 2018, 2019, and 2020 electricity bills for a City Hall Account found that during the pandemic (May-September):
- Costs remained consistent
- Energy use declined

At minimum, shows telework is a potential mechanism for the City to meet its energy efficiency goal(s)

Note: Utility bill data was not available for April 2019. To account for this we removed April data from 2018 and 2020 to not skew the results. Utility costs for April 2018 and 2020 were approximately $6800 and $2800 respectively. Energy usage for April 2018 and 2020 were approximately 62,000 kWh and 44,000 kWh respectively.

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Employees’ Telework Experience

Service Levels

Since teleworking began, service levels have remained consistent. In fact, 24% stated that service levels have increased.

- “I believe interaction with the public has increased through the use of video conference technology. I believe it is easier for our public to gain access to us quickly using these technologies rather than having to make a trip in to a City facility. It saves them time.”

- “Having a paperless environment with more online solutions, allows us to more efficiently process changes, answer questions, provide support.”

- “I have been able to meet more regularly with customers due to the online video meetings. I also spend less time travelling to and from meetings at different facilities which increases the time I'm available to provide a higher level of service…”

- “I believe customer service has improved due to increased employee morale…”

- “Our phone service level (how many calls we are able to answer promptly) has increased to nearly 100% everyday whereas before it could be as low as 75%.”

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Employees’ Telework Experience

• “Prior to telecommuting I had a very long commute. I had no work/life balance during the week. With telecommuting…I am more rested and happy in general and more productive at work.”

• “Working remotely has made big changes in my life. My productivity is increased with less distractions. I am able to use my commute time to get more done at work and at home.”

• “I think WFH is a valuable tool to provide some work/life balance for employees. I have not seen a decrease in productivity from my team during this time. I would love to see a hybrid option going forward…”

• “For my position, there is no loss of productivity when working from home. Field visits are done as needed.”

• “It was a very quick transition…I will say that at first…I wasn’t sure how it could work long term. However we began to change and grow as a department together and when challenges arose I always had a lot of assistance. While the first month or 2 had some bumps in the process, I have found increased productivity due to my environment, overall well-being and less stress since that initial time.”

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.

Own Productivity

Since teleworking began, 63 percent of respondents report increasing their productivity.
Management Considerations

• **Should Teleworking Become a Scheduling Option, It Will Be Necessary To:**
  
  • Identify positions that are telework suitable and those that require on-site attendance
  
  • Develop clear expectations for work hours, staff availability, and staff response time to customer, colleague, and management inquiries
  
  • Develop key indicators for monitoring service delivery
  
  • Develop key indicators for monitoring employee performance
Employees’ Telework Experience

Benefits Experienced

- 65 percent or more of respondents report the following as somewhat to very important benefits experienced while telecommuting:
  - Work/Life Balance
  - Increased Productivity
  - Positive Environmental Impact
  - Reduced Commuting Costs

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Employees’ Telework Experience

Challenges Experienced

- 35 percent or more of respondents report home office set up as somewhat to very challenging while telecommuting.
- 24 percent or more reported technological resource needs and access to documents and other work files as somewhat to very challenging while telecommuting.

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Employees’ Telework Experience

Resources City Provided and Not Provided

Respondents reported that more ergonomic equipment and resources would improve the teleworking experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource</th>
<th>City Provided</th>
<th>Not Provided</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Computer</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VPN Access</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directions for Accessing City Portals</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remotely</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on Internet Security</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ergonomic Equipment/Resources</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- “If the City was open to providing office equipment to those working at home such as a second monitor, ergonomic keyboards and other office equipment…I feel that more work could be done in shorter amounts of time… working on spreadsheets and multiple documents [is] difficult to do on a laptop.”

- “…my desk set up with two large screens for the 4 programs I work on at once [is] more effective and efficient than my laptop. Also, my kitchen table and chairs are not comfortable like my work set up.”

- “An office chair, if that is even possible, and a second screen monitor to be able to view more since the laptop screen is smaller than the office computers.”

- “Ability to access or offer discounted desks/chairs from a vendor.”

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Employees’ Telework Experience

- “I believe the VPN service can be improved to be more seamlessly integrated into work-from-home computers. Though not directly related to working from home I also believe the City should invest in software that allows for a document to be shared and edited by multiple people at the same time. This would allow for improved collaboration. The City should invest in Microsoft Teams and allow people to call phones from their Microsoft Teams account.”

- “Direct portal into City work space. Not website access VPN, but actual operation on the City computer desktop as soon as you open your computer. More robust, less glitches. West Hollywood is doing this.”

- “… Also, VPN is often slow…it would be much preferred to have a system like OneDrive where the entire network is on the cloud.”

- “There are City applications that operate better if done without the VPN. This requires the City to expand its VPN network to make this work remotely without issues.”

Although respondents report receiving VPN access, they also commented that other cloud-based options would provide more seamless access to City networks.

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Management Considerations

• **Should Teleworking Become a Scheduling Option, It Will Be Necessary To:**
  
  • Ensure that teleworkers have appropriate internet access (e.g. bandwidth, speed, etc.)
    
    – Some VPN issues related to inadequate internet capacity in home
  
  • Clearly identify expectations for home office setup in terms of equipment and furniture
    
    – Equipment City will provide
    
    – Equipment teleworker is expected to have
If offered under non-emergency circumstances, 95 percent of respondents would telework with 77 percent of them seeing themselves working three or more days from home.
Telework support is strong regardless of years employed with the City.

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
When asked whether the respondents’ departments solicit feedback from customers:

- 41 percent answered “Yes”
  - Respondents largely from Community Services and Public Works Department – which are public facing departments

- 58 percent answered “No” or “Did Not Know” to soliciting customer feedback
  - Respondents largely from the Community Development Department – which is a public facing department

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
Employees’ Telework Experience

Departments Solicit Feedback from Own Staff

When asked whether the respondents’ departments solicit feedback from them about their work experience:

- 52 percent answered “Yes”
- 48 percent answered “No” or “Do Not Know”

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
### Teleworking Policies in Jurisdictions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City/County</th>
<th>Policy Status</th>
<th>IT Platform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City/County San Francisco</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Sacramento</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of San Jose</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Info Not Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County of Los Angeles</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Santa Monica</td>
<td>Telework Policy Not Public; Teleworking Due to Pandemic</td>
<td>Info Not Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Beverly Hills</td>
<td>Teleworking Due to Pandemic Pilot Program</td>
<td>Cloud Capabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of West Hollywood</td>
<td>Temporary</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State of Arizona</td>
<td>State Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Google Workspace)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** Microsoft 365 includes Teams, One Note, and Windows applications such as Word and Excel. Google Workspace includes Drive, Gmail, and Google Meet.

In five of the eight jurisdictions we reviewed, teleworking was already an employee scheduling option pre-pandemic and five of the eight use cloud-based platforms. The City of Beverly Hills has cloud capabilities.

Source: OCA generated based on data research on benchmarked cities and counties.
## Teleworking Policies in Private Organizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business</th>
<th>Policy Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Google   | • Expanding beyond pandemic-teleworking  
          | • Working on hybrid model after internal survey revealed employees want to return to office at some point, but not everyday  
          | • Value in-person interactions but need to create more worker flexibility |
| Microsoft| • As of October 2020, working from home part-time is standard  
          | • Part time is less than 50 percent of the time  
          | • Assumes manager and team alignment  
          | • Not committing to every employee working from anywhere – essential onsite roles excluded and still sees value in employees being together in workplace |
| Nationwide| • Shifted 98%+ of 27,000 employees to remote working after declared pandemic  
             | • Making work-from-home permanent for many employees  
             | • Reducing office spaces from 20 physical offices to four  
             | • Tracked performance indicators and results were the same as pre-pandemic |
| Twitter  | • Announced in May 2020 it will offer telework as permanent option  
          | • Onsite attendance still required for jobs requiring physical presence |

In summary, private businesses are expanding remote working options beyond the pandemic. These companies have expressed that employee well-being, flexibility, and productivity are contributors to their decisions.

Source: OCA generated based on a review of company publications and published information.
Management Considerations

• Should Teleworking Become a Scheduling Option:

  • City has the IT infrastructure:
    – Has phone and VPN equipment for applicable employees
    – Has secure shared drive for employee document sharing
    – Has web-based methods for accessing City portals (e.g. MUNIS timesheets, etc.)
    – Planning to implement Microsoft 365

  • City needs to determine how it envisions incorporating teleworking and develop policies and staff expectations accordingly
    – Includes reimbursements, etc.
    – Employee Expectations and Monitoring
Management Considerations

• Should Teleworking Become a Scheduling Option:
  • City will need to embrace the culture shift to a hybrid work environment and tech savvy society
    – In-person, phone app, video conferencing, online portals, text/chat with customer service staff, etc.
    – Embracing various means of communication:
      » Does not diminish the in-person experience for those who seek it
      » Provides the City with more efficient means to meet the needs of all of its customers
    – Inform staff about and provide training on how to use available technological resources
    – Assist the public with acclimating to various options for conducting business through public awareness campaigns, etc.
Using a balanced scorecard approach is one method for helping the City align strategies with daily operations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Balanced Scorecard Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Hard Costs: Benefits gained from the investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Soft Costs: Any monetary savings from gains in productivity, staff morale, recruitment and retention, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Customers</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Methods of accessing City Hall for:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Senior Clientele <em>(limited mobility)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Those Preferring In-Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Busy Clientele <em>(need answer in the space they’re in at the time they connect)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Convenience Clientele <em>(Tech-savvy customers)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Social Distancing <em>(likely to continue in 2021)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internal Business</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increase Productivity and Quality of Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Downsizing staff due to retirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Maximize existing staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Staff Recruitment and Retention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Improve Internal Processes for Efficiency Improvements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Staff/Management embrace of technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Innovation and Learning</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Information System Capabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Secure, Flexible, Scalable, Facilitative Of Worker Productivity, Customer Service Friendly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• City’s vision for enhanced City Hall over next 5-10 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Walk-In Only, Virtual Options, Hybrid Services, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Real-Time Analytics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Is the City Meeting Customer Expectations?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Are There Better Ways to Organize City Staff?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents’ Ideas for Innovation

- Respondents’ Ideas for Innovation
  - We asked respondents:
    - *When thinking about the future of Beverly Hills, ideally, how could the use of data and technology improve your ability to do your job and improve customer service-delivery?*
    - *Assuming resources were plentiful, and the organizational culture was supportive, do you have any innovative ideas you would seek to explore/pilot/implement in your department to improve operations and customer service-delivery?*

  - Ideas Included:
    - Creating a 4-1-1 Customer Information Line
    - Continuing to offer remote testing and interviewing online for HR recruitment
    - Enhancing the City’s Permitting System by providing data for customers to conduct own research, which could potentially reduce inquiries to City staff
    - Automating services

- A summary of the submissions can be found in Appendix III: Respondents’ Ideas for Innovation
Key Takeaways

• City:
  • Has technological capacity to incorporate collaborative/productivity/communication platforms
  • Has workforce that is tech-savvy and/or ready to embrace technology
  • Has a need to maximize existing workforce while simultaneously providing efficient, effective, and quality services (internal/external)
  • Is in the midst of a culture shift that requires:
    – Commitment by City leadership and staff to seize present opportunities
    – A re-examination of how the City will conduct business
      » E.g. hybrid service options: in-person, virtual, online chat, mobile apps, etc.
      » E.g. hybrid workspaces (e.g. onsite, remote, in-field, etc.)
    – Aligning policies and procedures with evolving operations
      » E.g. staff expectations
      » E.g. IT security protocols and internal controls
    – Public awareness campaign
      » Bringing the public along in the transition to 21st Century government
In Closing

In the words of one of the respondents:

“I think this experience has shown that the City of Beverly Hills needs to embrace the future and become more technologically advanced to keep up with customer demands and expectations. During teleworking, I hear the same complaint from customers that I heard when working in the office: That they are unhappy and unimpressed with our service options and expect more from The City of Beverly Hills. This is an opportunity for the City of Beverly Hills to re-evaluate and re-focus our attention to engage with the public the way they prefer: digitally. Customers have always wanted a phone application that was a one stop shop for all city related business. Customers have always wanted accurate, automated updates on their inquiries and requests. Most of all, customers want to be able to handle everything they need from the comfort of their homes.”

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
The Office of the City Auditor (OCA) conducted a survey of teleworking employees within the Confidential, Management and Professional (M&P) and Municipal Employees Association (MEA) between October 22, 2020 and December 1, 2020. The purpose of the survey was to obtain staff feedback on their telework experience and ideas for innovation within their respective departments’ operations.

The survey found that a majority of respondents reported that since they began teleworking, service levels have remained about the same, with roughly a quarter of respondents reporting increases. Respondents also reported increased levels of personal productivity, better work/life balance, and reduced commuting costs.

Additionally, the survey highlighted respondents’ concerns regarding the use of personal cell phones for business purposes. While current City technology allows employees to forward calls from desk lines to cell phones, respondents: 1) expressed discomfort with using their private cell phones; 2) noted a loss in productivity as managing multiple phone calls from a cell phone was less than efficient; and 3) suggested that if personal phones are used, the City should reimburse costs. Respondents also raised the issue of reimbursement as it relates to home office setup and equipment and supplies.

We are sharing the information within because, while the survey occurred during the pandemic, the issues raised by respondents are not temporary and not exclusive to a pandemic working environment. Also, during the Entrance Conference for the Government Innovation Audit, Human Resources staff inquired about expenses related to telework reimbursement, what reimbursement would look like, and how reimbursements would be evaluated. This memo is a fact sheet that summarizes benchmarking conducted on telework reimbursement policies and telework guidance in various municipalities.
In Appendix I, we summarize research related to reimbursement policies for teleworking employees. While some entities already have existing telework pandemic mitigation strategies and directives shifted employees from an office environment to a remote one. In many cases, costs associated with office supplies, phone usage, and other work-related costs shifted to employees. Literature and discussions on this topic are evolving and as such, we only offer a snapshot of current discourse. We offer no legal opinions and strongly recommend that Human Resources and City Management consult with the City Attorney’s Office for further advisement.

In Appendix II, we reviewed the City and County of San Francisco, the County of Los Angeles, and the cities of Sacramento, San Jose, Santa Monica, and West Hollywood. For each benchmarked entity, we identified the purpose of the telework policy, described benefits, and employee eligibility criteria, and reimbursement guidance.

Additionally, we summarize agreement options (e.g. working from home, a shared workspace, etc.), telework safety conditions that must be met for approval, and security requirements and applicable laws. Lastly, we identify if there is a central repository for telework information (e.g. website) and identify key concepts that are specific to the policies (e.g. training requirements, etc.).

Eduardo Luna
City Auditor
Appendix 1: California Law and COVID-19-Related Reimbursement Expense Considerations

This topic is one best vetted by the legal experts and the City Attorney’s Office and we offer no legal opinions. To that end, the sources we cite and reviewed offer no legal opinions as well. We do however, provide a summation of current discourse on reimbursement expenses as it relates to California law and/or practices of other jurisdictions and/or countries.

California Labor Code Section 2802 states that:

“An employer shall indemnify his or her employee for all necessary expenditures or losses incurred by the employee in direct consequence of the discharge of his or her duties, or of his or her obedience to the directions of the employer…the term “necessary expenditures or losses” shall include all reasonable costs…”

Use of Personal Cell Phones

According to the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM), one example of a common business-related expense includes an employee’s use of a personal cell phone. An August 2019 SHRM article stated that:

- A California court case held that employers must reimburse employees when they are required to use their personal cell phone for work;
- If the actual cost of cell phone use cannot be determined, the employer is required to pay reimbursement for a “reasonable percentage” of the cell phone bill; and
- Employees must maintain all records related to the reimbursement request for three years.

In the employee telework survey, many respondents indicated that they are using personal cell phones to conduct City business (e.g. customer service calls with the public, answering the City Hotline, communicating with work colleagues, etc.). Benchmarking suggests that entities should have clearly defined policies about reimbursements for employees conducting business on personal cell phones. For the City of Beverly Hills (City), Administrative Regulation No. 3B.19 Cell Phone Procurement, Reimbursement and Use Policy (AR No. 3B.19), establishes a uniform policy and procedure for City-paid or reimbursed cell phones. According to AR No. 3B.19:

- City-owned cell phones may be issued to certain job classifications including Public Safety Officers, City Manager, Police and Fire Chiefs, and other positions as determined by the Department Head – with approval of City Manager.
MEMORANDUM

- Personal cell phone reimbursement allowances may be issued to:
  o Department Directors, Assistant Directors, and Senior Management employees required to procure and maintain own phone and service and/or who may need to be contacted on 24 hour/7 days per week basis;
  o Other City employees required by their department head to have a cell phone to conduct City business and/or may need to be contracted during their “on-duty” time; and
  o Other City employees who use their cell phone to conduct City business at the discretion of the department, according to City’s policy on reimbursing employee expenses, and for the actual costs of calls.

- All reimbursement for cell phone purchases or monthly service use, as well as issuance of City-owned cell service, is based upon fund availability within each department’s fiscal year budget.

Specific requirements and procedures are outlined in detail in the regulation.

General Sentiments Regarding COVID-19 Related Reimbursements for Internet and Supplies

While California stipulates that employees must be reimbursed for reasonable costs, the amount of the reimbursements for COVID-19-related equipment, supplies, and other costs can vary. To that end, literature available on this topic suggests that employers analyze the types of resources, supplies, costs, etc. used by employees during COVID-19 that may not have been an issue under voluntary work-from-home circumstances – such as home electricity, printer paper, personal cell phone use, etc. Also, while assessments of employee reimbursement expenses may be assessed on a case-by-case basis, it is prudent to develop baseline criteria.

Exhibit A.1 provides a high level overview of reimbursement considerations. In summary:

- Research suggests that employers develop reimbursement policies that best fit their respective workplaces, individual policies, workplace values, and budgetary constraints and that are in compliance with applicable laws and regulations. Examples include:
  o Twitter reimbursing employees (amount undisclosed) for home office setup expenses;
  o Uber providing a $500 stipend for home office setup expenses; and
  o Some employers paying a monthly stipend (e.g. $50) to employees who may already pay a monthly bill for private internet and cell phone use;
# Exhibit A.1: COVID-19-Related Employee Reimbursement Considerations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Reimbursement Considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Baker Hostetler, LLP</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **FAQs: Expense Reimbursement Amidst the New Work-From-Home Normal** | • Establish or revamp reimbursement policies  
  o Inform employees  
  • Historically, in office environment, employer provides supplies/resources (e.g. printer paper, pens/pencils, monitors, internet, electricity, phones, etc.)  
  o Employers should consider reimbursing costs such as a reasonable percentage of use of home electricity, personal cell phones, printer paper, pens/pencils, etc.  
  • Employers should assess expenses on case-by-case basis |
| **Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)** | **Telework and the Pandemic: California Employment Laws Still Apply** | • Draft remote-work agreements that include:  
  o Assessing what employees need to do their jobs vs preferences  
  o According to article, most people already pay for monthly data plans and internet access for phones and home computers  
  ▪ But when using for work, employers should provide stipend to defray costs (e.g. $50 p/month) |
| **Twitter Company Blog** | **By Jennifer Christie** (Chief HR Officer) | March 2020 | • All employees (includes hourly workers and contractors) to receive reimbursement for home office set-up expenses (amount undisclosed)  
  • Listened to employee feedback and expanded policy to include home office equipment (e.g. desks, chairs, ergonomic chair cushions)  
  • In May 2020, Twitter announced it was offering remote working as a permanent option |
| **Business Insider – Uber announces employees can work from home through June 2021, and its giving them $500 for their home office** | August 4, 2020 | • Corporate employees to receive $500 stipend for home office setup  
  • According to Uber Blog:  
  ▪ Instead of encouraging employees to work from kitchen counters or couches, help them upgrade their home office  
  • Consider a stipend to put towards furniture, tech, tools that improve concentration and comfort |
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS
OFFICE OF THE CITY AUDITOR

MEMORANDUM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Reimbursement Considerations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM) | • National Institute for Family Finance Information – in the Netherlands – determined average per/worker per/day workplace expenses as $2.40 USD  
  o Calculation includes what would normally be received free in the office during work hours – coffee/tea, toilet paper, internet access, utilities  
  ▪ Does not cover new furniture, computers, phones, other equipment employees should receive from employer  
  o Dutch authorities using research to provide $429 bonus to cover teleworking employees  
  o Counter-arguments  
  ▪ Bosses argue that extra payments make little sense when COVID-19 has negatively impacted economy  
  ▪ Calculations do not reflect benefits remote workers enjoy  
  ▪ Workers getting more free time in exchange – such as average time savings of daily commutes |
| When Should Employers Reimburse Expenses for Remote Workers⁹⁰ | |

Source: Auditor generated based on the sources cited within.

Within the City of Beverly Hills’ telework survey, we should note that respondents, in addition to using their personal cell phones for business purposes, indicated that they lacked ergonomic equipment and other in-home office set-up equipment (e.g. second monitor, chair, ergonomic keyboards, etc.). To that end, in addition to the aforementioned research on COVID-19 stipends, we should note that per our benchmarking, the City of San Jose, as part of its voluntary telework program, has an option to provide equipment to staff via a check-in and check-out procedure to minimize equipment costs to employees and/or equipment reimbursement costs for the City (See City of San Jose Benchmarking in Exhibit A.2).
Appendix II: Summary of Benchmarking Policies in Various Municipalities

This appendix summarizes telework guidance from various municipalities. As shown in Exhibit A.2, in four of the six jurisdictions we reviewed, teleworking was already an employee scheduling option pre-pandemic. Additionally, these cities use telework as a tool for addressing various strategic goals related to, but not limited to, recruitment and retention and decreasing energy consumption, air pollution, and traffic congestion. The cities of Santa Monica and West Hollywood are utilizing telework in a temporary capacity in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. As for reimbursements, cities with existing telework policies, with the exception of the City of Sacramento, clearly delineated reimbursable items.

Exhibit A.2: Elements in Telework Policies of Benchmarked Cities and Counties

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City/County/Entity</th>
<th>Policy Status</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Benefits of Teleworking</th>
<th>Eligibility Criteria</th>
<th>Policy &amp; Procedures</th>
<th>Reimbursement Guidance</th>
<th>Agreement Options</th>
<th>Worksite Requirements</th>
<th>Security and Laws</th>
<th>Telecommute Employee Website</th>
<th>Key Concepts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 City and County of San Francisco</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 City of Sacramento</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 City of San Jose</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 City of Santa Monica</td>
<td>No Policy Found</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 City of West Hollywood</td>
<td>Temporary</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 County of Los Angeles</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Auditor generated based on review of the telework policies, telework websites, etc. of the benchmarked entities within.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>City and County of San Francisco (City Practice)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Arrangement between eligible employees and City and County (City) employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Work in designated area outside of the office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Benefits of Teleworking</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Function during emergency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increased productivity and improved morale/job satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Efficient use of City resources, including office space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Recruitment and retention tool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Flexibility for employees and departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reduced employee absenteeism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reduced employee commute time and costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decreased energy consumption, air pollution, traffic congestion, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eligibility Criteria</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Based on position suitability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Including, but not limited to, the position having measurable deliverables and not requiring immediate presence at worksite to address unscheduled events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Based on employee eligibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Including, but not limited to, consistently high rate of productivity, effective communication skills, and high level skill and job knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy &amp; Procedures</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Telecommuting privilege, not a right</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Must have approved telecommuting agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Does not change employee duties, terms of employment, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employees must perform work during scheduled telecommuting hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employees must:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Read policy and guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Complete eLearning module</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Submit agreement for approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Complete telecommuting survey before telecommuting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reimbursement Guidelines</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Telecommuting intended to be cost neutral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>City not required/assumes no responsibility for:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Provide materials or supplies to establish alternate worksite (desk, chair, computer, software, cell phone, fax, copier, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Set-up or operating costs at alternate worksite (telephone, internet, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <strong>Departments have sole discretion to:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Provide equipment, software, supplies, or allow employees to use own</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## City and County of San Francisco (City Practice)

- Reimburse employees for costs of using personal equipment while telecommuting (should be clearly addressed in department’s telecommuting agreement)
  - If department does not have equipment and supplies and employee does not have them, employee not eligible to telecommute

### Agreement Options
- Agreements can be regular, recurring, or occasional
- Telecommuting employees must be available to work onsite if needed

### Worksite Requirements
- Employees must work in safe and efficient environment (City may request pictures)
- Employees covered by worker’ compensation laws

### Security and Laws
- All files, records, papers, other materials creating while telecommuting are City property
- Public Records Act and Sunshine Ordinance apply to telecommuting employees

### Telecommute Employee Webpage
- Yes [https://sfdhr.org/telecommute](https://sfdhr.org/telecommute)

### Key Concepts
- -
# City of Sacramento (City Practice)

**Purpose**
- Gives eligible employees opportunity to work in designated location away from office
- At discretion of City

**Benefits of Teleworking**
- Successful program meets needs of employee and employer

**Eligibility Criteria**
- Answer telecommute criteria questions
- City materials needed; specific tasks performing; method and frequency of communication with supervisor; description of work product review; process for evaluating satisfactory job performance

**Policy & Procedures**
- Teleworking is a voluntary work assignment
- Interested teleworkers must:
  - Review and complete telework criteria questions
  - Determine if need VPN access
  - Complete Telecommute Request Form
  - Sign policy documents, detail justification form, and VPN request form (if needed) received via email
  - Await approval
  - Set up remote office

**Reimbursement Guidance**
- None specified in telework policy
  - If interested, further review of City’s policies may be necessary to rule out

**Agreement Options**
- 

**Worksite Requirements**
- 

**Security and Laws**
- Teleworking website provides links to City policies, including IT Resource Policy

**Webpage**
- Yes [https://www.cityofsacramento.org/HR/Telecommute](https://www.cityofsacramento.org/HR/Telecommute)

**Key Concepts**
- City uses:
  - Office 365 (Outlook, email, SharePoint, Teams, One Drive, etc.
  - Cisco Jabber (Smartphone app allows making and receiving calls using desk phone number; can also check voicemail with Visual Voicemail, Call Forward, and make video calls)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>City of San Jose (City Practice)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Provide Flexibly Workplace Program (FWP)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Same as benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Benefits of Telecommuting</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Increase productivity by allowing employees to commute less and have more time with job duties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Support employee work/life balance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Reduce workforce carbon footprint through reduced trips</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Decrease traffic congestion by allowing employees to travel during non-peak hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Increase employee job satisfaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Attract and retain employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Protect employee health and safety and reduce risk of exposure to communicable disease, when necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Allow for continuity of government services during emergencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eligibility Criteria</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Permanent employee status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● At least six months (1040 hours) of employment with the City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Overall rating of “Meets Standards” or higher on most recent performance appraisal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Employees must be able to perform duties as productively offsite as at designated worksite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Participation should not lower service delivery of work unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Employees must have adequate internet and telecommunications capabilities to perform job requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Employee expenses not specifically covered in policy must be pre-approved by employee’s department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy &amp; Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agreement to schedule portions of work week away from regular worksite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees would work full workday</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Times and number of hours in office to be scheduled differently between individual days of the week</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FWP schedule must be consistent, approved before commencement, and combined with days and hours worked at worksite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under special circumstances or in the event of a declared emergency, employees who are able to work a majority or all of their scheduled hours remotely may be required to do so</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees, who occasionally work away from office and not on a regular basis, can do so upon approval; compensated according to terms of applicable MOU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inability to enter a FWP agreement shall not be subject to grievance procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remain unchanged</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Duties, obligations, responsibilities, and conditions of employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Salary, retirement, benefits, and City-sponsored insurance coverage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Obligation to comply with all City, State, and Federal rules, policies, and practices, and City Code of Ethics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violations of any policies or misuse of City time and equipment may result in preclusion from the program and/or disciplinary action – up to and including termination of employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o FWP voluntary and may be suspended or cancelled by employee or City/Department at any time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Termination is administrative and decision may not be subject to grievance procedure or appealed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Application and Approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Apply by completing Flexible Workplace Agreement and submit to supervisor for approval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Renew annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ In emergency, Department Directors may determine that employees are required to perform all or some of their duties remotely</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Scheduling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Operational needs of City take precedence over FWP schedule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Schedule occurs consistently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Shall be accessible as their on-site counterparts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Required to maintain communication with supervisors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Must forgo working off-site if needed in the office or worksite on day regularly scheduled for remote work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Time Accountability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Promptly respond to supervisors and team during work hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Messages communicated as urgent must be answered within 30 minutes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**City of San Jose (City Practice)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Environment</th>
<th>Actual time worked must be accurately recorded on timesheet; fraudulent reporting is subject to discipline – up to and including termination from City service</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Work Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Designated workspace shall be approved by City and maintained by employee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Workspace subject to inspections, upon request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Participant responsible for any cost related to remodeling and setup of designated workspace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Subject to approval by Department Director, employees may take minor office equipment home – including computer peripherals and chairs; Participant must follow all department check-in and check-out procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment</td>
<td>Participant required to have installed and maintained at own expense:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Internet enabled device with internet access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Required applications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Sufficient power/storage to run programs to efficiently perform job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Department may decide to provide equipment/software who works at FWP location at least 60 percent of the time; Equipment/software remains property of City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
<td>Since not every task can be quantifiably measured, supervisor should establish clear expectations and guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Employees required to participate in all studies, inquiries, reports, and analysis, including annual survey, relating to the program (individual responses will not be published but data compiled and made available to public without identification of employees)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ Each department designates FWP representative for department’s program evaluation (e.g. monitoring changes in employee retention and absenteeism, changes in required parking spaces, reports on employee productivity, etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reimbursement Guidance**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reimbursement Guidance</th>
<th>Responsibility of employee:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Expenses for long distance calls made out of designated office location, unless otherwise indicated by department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o All internet related expenses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Individual tax implications related to home workspace modifications</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Agreement Options**

| Agreement Options | - |

**Worksite Requirements**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Worksite Requirements</th>
<th>FWP workstation is an extension of City’s workspace</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employees encouraged to watch City’s safety, hygiene, and ergonomics training videos to ensure proper set-up of workspace</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## City of San Jose (City Practice)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Security and Laws</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Security</td>
<td>o Security information is valuable City asset and must be protected from unauthorized, incorrect, or accidental access, use modification, destruction or disclosure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Must comply with City Policy Manual Section 1.7.6 Information Security Policy and Section 1.7.3 Remote Access.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Worker’s Compensation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o FWP participants covered under City’s Workers’ Compensation Insurance Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Employee remains liable for injuries to third parties and/or members of employee’s family on employee’s premises.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Telecommute Employee Webpage</th>
<th>-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Concepts</th>
<th>• Conducts annual survey for the FWP Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
## City of Santa Monica (Appears Temporary)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>• Some of City workforce telecommuting in response to COVID-19 pandemic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of Telecommuting</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eligibility Criteria</td>
<td>• Only essential staff will work onsite while most of workforce will telework and collaborate through teleconferencing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Policy & Procedures                                                     | • Telework policy, if existent, not on City website  
  o If interested, further research necessary  
  o No mention of telework policies in Confidential Unrepresented Employees, Management Team Association, and Municipal Employees Association union agreements |
| Reimbursement Guidance                                                 | -                                                                     |
| Agreement Options                                                       | -                                                                     |
| Worksite Requirements                                                   | -                                                                     |
| Security and Laws                                                       | -                                                                     |
| Telecommute Employee Webpage                                           | -                                                                     |
| Key Concepts                                                            | -                                                                     |
# City of West Hollywood (Temporary)

## Purpose
- Temporary telecommuting due to COVID-19 outbreak and guidance
  - State and County departments of public health regarding social distancing
  - City of West Hollywood City Council

## Benefits of Telecommuting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eligibility Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Temporary policy applies Citywide</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departments strongly encouraged to make telecommuting available to all eligible employees in their departments in support of public health goals of limiting spread of virus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not all positions telecommute eligible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General guidelines include, but are not limited to:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work that can be performed away from workplace without need for regular public contact or frequent interaction with supervisor, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee’s immediate presence at regular worksite to address City business or public safety is not regularly required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work not essential to on-site workflow</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Policy & Procedures
- Telecommuting
  - Is a privilege, not a right
  - Is within discretion of Division Manager or Department Head
  - Arrangements will terminate when City Council proclaims termination of Local Emergency
  - Agreement between City and employee for employee to work in designated area outside office, including from home
  - Telecommuting may be combined with or also require working from regular job site
  - Division Manager or Department Director may deny, end, or modify Emergency Telecommuting Agreement, but not unreasonably
    - Telecommuting employee may end telecommuting at any time
  - Employees approved for telework must:
    - Sign City’s Emergency Telecommuting Agreement
      - Division/Department maintain copy and provide copy to HR
    - Perform regular job duties and obligations and abide by terms of employment
      - Employees may be assigned tasks/assignments outside regular duties during emergency to provide opportunities to perform job duties that can be done remotely
      - Employees must perform all work during scheduled telecommuting hours and be available via phone, email, instant messaging, web conferencing (e.g. Microsoft Teams)
    - Employees must perform work during scheduled hours and report time spent telecommuting
      - Required to complete City activity log tracking hours worked
      - Must receive authorization to work overtime
### City of West Hollywood (Temporary)

- Must obtain approval to use sick leave, vacation leave, etc.
  - Comply with all City rules, policies, practices, and instructions
    - Failure to adhere to telecommuting policy, not meeting performance expectations, or not being responsive during scheduled shift will result in immediate termination of agreement

### Reimbursement Guidance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not required to provide employees with materials or supplies needed to establish alternate worksite (e.g. desk, chair, computer, cell phone, copier, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumes no responsibility for set up or operating costs at alternate worksite (e.g. telephone or internet services)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not responsible for damage to personal equipment or property while telecommuting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Departments:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>May, not required to, provide equipment, software, supplies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
  - If so, City may prohibit use of personal equipment |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cell Phones</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-exempt employees who telecommute, and use personal mobile device, in normal course of duties while telecommuting are eligible to receive cell phone stipend provided to exempt employees in their bargaining unit during term of Emergency Telework Agreement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
  - Must submit written request for stipend to HR and indicate reason why employee using own personal device while telecommuting |

### Agreement Options

- -

### Worksite Requirements

| Must designate work area suitable for safe, efficient, confident performance of duties |

### Security and Laws

| Must protect City documents, equipment, software, and supplies (if provided) from theft, damage, and loss |
| Injuries sustained in home location and in conjunction with regular work duties normally covered by City’s workers’ compensation policy |
  - Employees liable for any injuries sustained by visitors to home worksite |
| If City receives Public Records Act request (subject to certain exemptions), a telecommuting employee must permit inspection and examination (regardless of whether record is located —such as personal computer or personal mobile device) |

### Telecommute Employee Webpage

- -

### Key Concepts

- -
## County of Los Angeles (City Practice)

### Purpose
- Established in 1989 and expanded since
- Innovative workplace option
- Contribute to improvement of work quality, increased productivity, achievement of air quality and traffic reduction goals
- Management approved arrangement allowing employee to perform work duties during any part of regularly scheduled hours at approved alternative worksite

### Benefits of Telecommuting
- Supports County’s Strategic Plan and strategies including “Realizing Tomorrow’s Government Today”
- Supports community wellness
- Environmental sustainability
  - Includes support of the County’s Clean Air efforts
- Inspires development of workforce
- Embraces digital government
- Promotes operational effectiveness, fiscal responsibility, accountability
- Encourages engagement and information sharing

### Eligibility Criteria
- Based on completion of procedures and receipt of requisite approvals

### Policy & Procedures
- Employees must follow policies, standards, and procedures to remain eligible
- Prior to participating, employees and supervisors required to obtain certificate of completion from County Telework Training
- Procedures (Appendix 1-7 in Manual)
  - Register and complete online training
  - Complete teleworker agreement
    - Agreement
    - Telework Location Safety Checklist
    - Telework Task Schedule to manage performance and deliverables (completed at discretion of Telemanager)
    - Telework Supervisor’s Checklist (at discretion of Telemanager)
  - Employee begins telework and reports hours
  - Complete Telework Job Performance Survey at 90-Day milestone to assess job performance
  - Telework may be discontinued at any time
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County of Los Angeles (City Practice)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reimbursement Guidance</strong></td>
<td>• County will not pay for, or reimburse for:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Maintenance/repair of personal equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Utility costs from use of electronics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Costs associated with occupation of the home/offsite location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Out of pocket expenses for supplies regularly available at County office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• County will reimburse business-related telephone calls on personal telephone or cellphone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agreement Options</strong></td>
<td>• Hoteling – Alternative work arrangement where work from County facility other than primary location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Co-Working – Alternate work arrangement where employee shared workplace with other organizations and agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Home – Approved remote site of employee’s choosing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Worksite Requirements</strong></td>
<td>• Employee Telework Location Home Safety Checklist (Appendix 2 in Manual)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Security and Laws</strong></td>
<td>• County’s Information and Security Requirements and Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Telecommute Employee Webpage</strong></td>
<td>Yes <a href="https://employee.hr.lacounty.gov/telework-2/">https://employee.hr.lacounty.gov/telework-2/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Key Concepts</strong></td>
<td>• Policy states that:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Telework program can be further developed with support of new technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Need to move beyond home-based and short-term telework when prompted by emergency or personal injury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>o Key for success is clear and collaboratively defined expectations and provide options, tools, flexibility to meet objectives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
REFERENCES


iv Ibid


viii Uber for Business Uber Blog: “7 Benefits remote workers need now more than ever,” August 12, 2020: https://www.uber.com/blog/7-benefits-for-remote-workers/


The Office of the City Auditor (OCA) conducted a survey of teleworking employees within the Confidential, Management and Professional (M&P), and Municipal Employees Association (MEA) between October 22, 2020 and December 1, 2020. The purpose of the survey was to obtain staff feedback on their telework experience and ideas for innovation within their respective departments’ operations.

The survey found that approximately 24 percent of respondents reported that accessing documents and other work files and technological resource needs was somewhat to very challenging to their remote working experiences. Moreover, while most respondents reported having VPN access, they commented that cloud-based and other collaborative and productivity platforms (e.g. platforms with chat, videoconferencing, document sharing, and etc.) would improve their productivity. They also expressed that VPN can be glitchy, slow, and does not always allow for direct portal access into City workspaces.

Respondents also reported the use of personal cell phones for business use. While current City technology allows for calls to be forwarded from desk lines to cell phones, respondents: 1) expressed discomfort with using their private cell phones; 2) noted a loss in productivity as managing multiple phone calls from a cell phone was less than efficient; and 3) suggested that if personal phones are used, the City should reimburse costs. The issues expressed related to the use of personal cell phones may be partially remedied via technology (e.g. use of voice over IP (VoIP) services and software and applications that facilitate call management) and/or equipment (such as office desktop telephones used in home settings).

We are sharing the information within because, while the survey occurred during the pandemic, the issues raised by respondents are not temporary and not exclusive to a pandemic working environment. We also conducted benchmarking and found that other jurisdictions use remote working as a standard scheduling option and use cloud-based and other technologies to support operations. The technological platforms are flexible, secure, scalable, and facilitative of worker productivity.

Based on our conversation with IT, the City’s technological infrastructures has the same capacity. The City has phone and VPN equipment available for applicable employees, has secure shared drive options for document sharing, and has web-based methods for accessing
City portals. Additionally, the IT Department, as part of its strategic plan, intends to implement Microsoft 365 (which includes Microsoft Teams, One Drive, etc.) in the near future.

As described in the included benchmarking, city and state governments have already invested in technological platforms that can adapt to a work from anywhere, be productive anywhere, and interact with customers and colleagues in various ways environments. Hybrid in-office and remote organizational structures will most likely outlast the pandemic.¹ Now, is an opportune time for the City to identify or re-visit its strategic goals related to remote working, worker productivity and collaboration, and customer-service delivery for 21st Century government.

Eduardo Luna
City Auditor

Survey Summary

The Office of the City Auditor conducted a survey of teleworking employees to obtain feedback about their telework experience and ideas for innovation in their respective departments’ operations. As it related to information technology, key results include:

- Approximately 59 percent of respondents reporting that they received a City-issued computer;
- Approximately 86 percent of respondents reporting they received VPN access;
- Approximately 24 percent of respondents identifying access to documents and other work files as somewhat to very challenging;
- Approximately 28 percent of respondents identifying technological resource needs as somewhat to very challenging; and
- Approximately 54 percent of respondents reporting they received information on internet security.

Notably, while respondents reported receiving VPN access, they commented that other cloud-based options would provide more seamless access to City networks and that work productivity platforms would increase team collaboration, public access, and worker efficiency. Comments included:

- “I believe the VPN service can be improved to be more seamlessly integrated into work-from-home computers. Though not directly related to working from home I also believe the City should invest in software that allows for a document to be shared and edited by multiple people at the same time. This would allow for improved collaboration. The City should invest in Microsoft Teams and allow people to call phones from their Microsoft Teams account.”
- “… Also, VPN is often slow…it would be much preferred to have a system like OneDrive where the entire network is on the cloud.”
- “There are City applications that operate better if done without the VPN. This requires the City to expand its VPN network to make this work remotely without issues.”
- “Direct portal into City work space. Not website access VPN, but actual operation on the City computer desktop as soon as you open your computer. More robust, less glitches. West Hollywood is doing this.”
- “I believe the most important technology for more productivity is having collaborative software to allow multiple people to edit documents simultaneously like in Google Docs, without having to have multiple versions being passed around.”
- “If our desk numbers can operate similar to Google Voice numbers, it would be nice to access voicemails, call logs, and send/receive text messages through a web browser.”
- “A lot of things have worked well. It would be GREAT if we had more software/programs that allowed us to collaborate more. For example, City of WeHo uses “teams” and some
cities use Google-based products that allow multiple people to edit documents collaboratively, etc. This would help us A GREAT DEAL, as this has been one of the biggest challenges…” Additionally, a lot of our applications online are glitchy in general or only work on certain browsers, and this is even more problematic during wfh as we try to help customers remotely.²

Key Takeaways

There are a three key takeaways based on feedback from the survey, the current remote working environment, our conversation with IT, and the present opportunity to strategize a response to evolving technological needs. First, some respondents indicated that they are using their personal cell phones for business purposes. In discussions with the IT Department (IT), management indicated that IT has equipment (e.g. desktop phones, VPN routers, etc.) available for applicable positions that would allow employees to use City-issued equipment to conduct business, that would allow for call management, and that would allow for quick and secure access to City networks. However, according to IT, in some instances, initial attempts at the beginning of the pandemic to distribute this equipment was met with staff resistance. As employee sentiments may have changed given the prolonged pandemic and as staff continue to adjust to the remote working environment, re-visiting distribution may be met with less resistance.

Secondly, as aforementioned, some respondents suggested the use of collaborative platforms to increase productivity. Respondents mentioned cloud computing through platforms associated with Microsoft and Google. Cloud computing is also available through telecommunications vendors – such as Avaya (the City’s existing vendor) and Mitel. Such platforms may also provide other productivity benefits such as chat, visual voicemail, audio and video conferencing, call center analytics, and other features that would benefit in-office work as well. We should note that we are not endorsing or recommending any specific products. Software and hardware choices are based on IT’s assessment of needs, internal controls, security, change management, etc. We are however, sharing the sentiment that respondents are tech-savvy and seemingly ready to embrace newer technologies. To that end, according to IT, as part of its strategic plan, it is preparing to upgrade the City’s Microsoft platforms.

Lastly, IT has the capacity to address the feedback expressed by the respondents and that can support the strategic direction chosen by the City to enhance internal operations and customer service-delivery. Notably, once the City: 1) has a uniform plan that outlines its goals moving forward regarding hybrid workspaces and service options; and 2) aligns policies and procedures to meet those goals, IT can better integrate technology to support City objectives.

² This responder also noted that GoToMeeting is a limited platform.
IT Platforms Used in Other Jurisdictions

We benchmarked IT platforms in eight other jurisdictions and, as shown in Exhibit 1, found that five of them are using cloud-based platforms such as Microsoft 365 and Google Workspace. The State of Arizona (Arizona) reported migrating over 90 agencies and roughly 40 thousand workers to Google Workspace. As noted earlier, the City of Beverly Hills currently has cloud capabilities and intends to upgrade its platforms. Moreover, as shown, five of the jurisdictions already had remote scheduling options as a practice.

Exhibit 1: Teleworking Policies in Other Jurisdictions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jurisdictions</th>
<th>Telework Policy Status</th>
<th>IT Platform</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City/County San Francisco</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Sacramento</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County of Los Angeles</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of West Hollywood</td>
<td>Temporary</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Microsoft 365)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of San Jose</td>
<td>City Practice</td>
<td>Info Not Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Santa Monica</td>
<td>Telework Policy Not Public; City Currently Teleworking</td>
<td>Info Not Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City of Beverly Hills</td>
<td>Pilot</td>
<td>Cloud Capabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State of Arizona</td>
<td>State Practice</td>
<td>Cloud-Based (Google Workspace)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Microsoft 365 includes Teams, One Note, and Windows applications such as Word and Excel. Google Workspace includes Drive, Gmail, and Google Meet with chat and meeting features.
Source: OCA generated based on research on benchmarked cities, counties, and the State of Arizona.

City of West Hollywood Memorandum of Understanding for Office 365 Implementation

In May 2019, WeHo initiated services to begin citywide implementation of Office 365. In its analysis, WeHo identified the following as the purposes and benefits of implementation:

- WeHo’s core platform and technologies use Microsoft products and services for service-delivery;
- Office 365 offers flexibility by allowing employees to work from anywhere, anytime, using any device and encourages environmentally friendly practices through paperless interactions, lessening the need for recycling and disposal of documents;
- Due to the growing importance of mobile workforce, on-demand technology, security, and resiliency, migration keeps the city’s technology current, secure, highly available,
efficient, and cost effective – this includes always receiving the latest security and critical updates with no additional charge;

- Moving to Office 365 would enhance productivity, security, and reliability and provide a holistic set of productivity tools – including Word, Excel, PowerPoint, Access, Publisher, Outlook, One Note, One Drive, Teams, and SharePoint;
- Efficiently utilizing the use of the City’s shared hardware and software resources by removing ten total on-premise servers; and
- Allowing for scalable growth without increasing the need for future hardware, storage, and backup costs.

Based on a review of WeHo’s agreements with CompuCom Systems, ConvergeOne, and Software One for Microsoft implementation and licenses, between Fiscal Years (FY) 18-19 and FY 20-21, contract amounts are as outlined in Exhibit 2.

Exhibit 2: Budgeted Office 365 Implementation and Licensing Costs for the City of West Hollywood Between Fiscal Years 18-19 and 20-21

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vendor</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CompuCom Systems</td>
<td>• Expires June 30, 2022&lt;br&gt;• Lead migration planning and implementation service (Evaluate, Plan, Build, Deploy, Operate)</td>
<td>$200,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ConvergeOne</td>
<td>• Expires June 30, 2022&lt;br&gt;• On call services to provide remote or on-site engineering resources</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Software One</td>
<td>• Provides Additional Microsoft Office 365 licensing</td>
<td>$323,808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>$623,808</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: OCA generated based on review of the May 6, 2019 City Council Consent Item for the Agreement for Services for Microsoft Office 365 Implementation, Related Software and Licenses.

**Recently Identified Pandemic and National Security Risks**

While IT may already be aware of recently identified pandemic and national security risks, we are including a summary in this memo for due diligence and as a reminder about the importance of ongoing IT security assessments.

On December 2, 2020, the Interpol (International Criminal Police Organization) issued a warning that criminals could target vaccine supply chains and that criminals could target the public via
fake websites and vaccine scams. The Interpol noted that governments should consider these risks as they could be impacted as they prepare to roll out vaccines to their citizens. It also noted that fake websites touting false cures could also pose a significant risk to citizens’ health and safety. Addressing these risks within the City will require public safety, IT, and Public Information Office collaboration.

On December 14, 2020, the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, along with private businesses, investigated and began responding to, a suspected, Russian hacking campaign. It is suspected that the hackers breached other federal departments and agencies, including Treasury, Commerce, the State Department, and the National Institute of Health. Additionally, on December 17, 2020, Politico reported that hackers accessed systems at the National Nuclear Security Administration, which maintains the U.S. nuclear weapons stockpile. In summary, hackers breached SolarWinds software, where its customers downloaded malicious software that allowed hackers to spy on businesses and agencies for roughly nine months. According to a Reuter’s article, SolarWinds noted that the attack was the work of an outside nation state and that the attackers inserted code into updates of SolarWinds’s Orion network management software between March and June 2020. The Microsoft Security Response Center, as well as other security software companies, drafted advisements for detecting and mitigating future attacks and residual impacts from the breach. The advisements included a non-exhaustive list of Indicators of Compromise (IOCs) for organizations to review.

---


6 Ibid

Appendix I: Telework and Innovation Survey Questions

RESPONDENT INFORMATION

1. Please identify your department.
   a. City Auditor
   b. City Clerk
   c. Community Development
   d. Community Services
   e. Finance
   f. Fire
   g. Human Resources
   h. Information Technology
   i. Police
   j. Policy and Management
   k. Public Works

2. What is your job title?

3. Please choose your bargaining unit.
   a. Confidential
   b. Executives
   c. Management and Professional
   d. MEA (Technical Services)
   e. Safety Support
   f. Supervisors

4. Please enter your residential zip code.

5. How many years have you been in your current position?
   a. Less than one year
   b. 1-5 years
   c. 6-10 years
   d. More than 10 years

6. How many years have you been an employee with the City of Beverly Hills?
   a. Less than one year
   b. 1-5 years
   c. 6-10 years
   d. More than 10 years

7. Does your current position require you to fully work onsite (e.g. a position that is not able to telework such an Equipment Mechanic, Solid Waste Equipment Operator, etc.)?
   a. Yes
   b. No
8. What percentage of your workday do you currently telecommute (work from home)?
Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

   a. Less than 50 Percent of the Time
   b. 50 Percent of the Time or More
   c. NA

9. If your position is one that requires interaction with the public (e.g. customer service, etc.), in your opinion, how has the level of service delivery changed since you began telecommuting? Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

   a. Decreased service-delivery
      i. Please explain your response.
   b. About the same service-delivery
      ii. Please explain your response.
   c. Increased level of service-delivery
      iii. Please explain your response.
   d. NA

10. In your opinion, how would you rate your work productivity since you began teleworking (Approximately March 2020)? Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

   a. Decreased Productivity
   b. About the Same Level of Productivity
   c. Increased Productivity
   d. NA

11. Since employees began teleworking as a result of the pandemic (March 2020) have you experienced any of the following? Check all that apply. Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

   a. Improved Work/Life Balance
      i. How important is improved work/life balance to your overall work experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)
   b. Increased Productivity
      i. How important is increased productivity to your overall work experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)
   c. Positive Environmental Impact (e.g. better air quality, reductions in traffic, etc.)
      i. How important is a positive environmental impact to your overall work experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)
   d. Reduced Absences
      i. How important are reduced absences to your overall work experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)
   e. Reduced Commuting Costs/Transit Subsidies
      i. How important are reduced commuting costs/transit subsidies to your overall work experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)
f. Increased Team Collaboration
   i. How important is increased team collaboration to your overall work experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)

g. Increased Communication from City Supervisors and Department Management
   i. How important is increased communication from City supervisors and department management to your overall work experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)

h. Increased Communication from City Administration (City Manager’s Office, Council, etc.)
   i. How important is increased communication from City Administration to your overall work experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Important to Very Important)

i. None
j. NA
k. Other (please specify)

12. Since the City implemented a telework policy as a result of the pandemic (March 2020), have you experienced challenges in any of the following areas? Check all that apply. Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

   a. Childcare
      i. How challenging did Childcare make your work from home experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Challenging to Very Challenging)

   b. Home Office Set Up
      i. How challenging did a Home Office Set Up make your work from home experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Challenging to Very Challenging)

   c. Technological Resource Needs (e.g. work computer, VPN, etc.)
      i. How challenging did Technological Resource Needs make your work from home experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Challenging to Very Challenging)

   d. Access to Documents and Other Work Files
      i. How challenging did Access to Documents and Other Work Files make your work from home experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Challenging to Very Challenging)

   e. Team Collaboration
      i. How challenging did Team Collaboration make your work from home experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Challenging to Very Challenging)

   f. Communication Issues (e.g. receiving timely information about City decisions, timely responses from co-workers, technical issues causing communication issues, etc.)
      i. How challenging did Communication Issues make your work from home experience?
         1. Scale 1-5 (Not Challenging to Very Challenging)

   g. Other (Please Specify)
   h. None
   i. NA
13. What tools and resources did the City provide you when teleworking began as a result of the pandemic (in approximately March 2020)?
Check all that apply. Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

a. Computer
   i. How helpful was a Computer to your work from home experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Helpful to Very Helpful)

b. VPN Access
   i. How helpful was VPN Access to your work from home experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Helpful to Very Helpful)

c. Directions for Accessing City Portals Remotely
   i. How helpful were Directions for Accessing City Portals Remotely to your work from home experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Helpful to Very Helpful)

d. Information on Internet Security
   i. How helpful was Information on Internet Security to your work from home experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Helpful to Very Helpful)

e. Ergonomic Equipment/Resources
   i. How helpful were Ergonomic Equipment/Resources to your work from home experience?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Helpful to Very Helpful)

f. Other (Please Specify)

h. NA

14. Are there any resources that you have not been provided that would improve teleworking? Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.

a. Computer
   i. How critical is a Computer to your continuing to work from home?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Critical to Very Critical)

b. VPN Access
   i. How critical is VPN Access to your continuing to work from home?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Critical to Very Critical)

c. Directions for Accessing City Portals Remotely
   i. How critical are Directions for Accessing City Portal Remotely to your continuing to work from home?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Critical to Very Critical)

d. Information on Internet Security
   i. How critical is Information on Internet Security to your continuing to work from home?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Critical to Very Critical)

e. Ergonomic Equipment/Resources
   i. How critical is Ergonomic Equipment/Resources to your continuing to work from home?
      1. Scale 1-5 (Not Critical to Very Critical)

f. Other (Please Specify)

g. NA
15. **While teleworking, did you request to visit your onsite workspace?** Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.
   a. Yes
      i. If yes, please describe the reason. (E.g. equipment, air conditioning, etc.)
   b. No
   c. NA

16. **If teleworking were incorporated as a work option under non-emergency circumstances, would you use it?** Select NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite.
   a. Yes
      i. If teleworking were incorporated as a work option under non-emergency circumstances, how many days per week would you see yourself telecommuting?
         1. 1
         2. 2
         3. 3
         4. 4 or more days
   b. No
   c. NA

17. **Is there anything that you would like to share about the telework experience, successes, obstacles, areas of concern, considerations, etc.?** Please share. Enter NA if you answered “Yes” to Question 7 – You fully work onsite

**SERVICE DELIVERY AND THE FUTURE**

18. **When thinking about the future of Beverly Hills, idealistically, how could the use of data and technology improve your ability to do your job and improve customer service-delivery?** (Please provide specific examples if you have any)

19. **Assuming resources were plentiful and the organizational culture were supportive, do you have any innovative ideas you would seek to explore/pilot/implement in your department to improve operations and customer service-delivery?**

20. **Does your department solicit feedback from customers about their level of satisfaction with service-delivery?**
   a. Yes
   b. No
   c. Do Not Know
21. Does your department solicit feedback from employees about their level of satisfaction with their working conditions (includes access to the resources necessary to successfully complete their job duties, management communications, etc.)?
   a. Yes
   b. No
   c. Do Not Know

22. Any information that you wish to share as a final thought?
Appendix II: COVID-19 Behavioral Risk Assessment *(Updated December 17, 2020)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Optimistic</th>
<th>Moderate</th>
<th>Pessimistic</th>
<th>Observations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Vaccines</strong></td>
<td>• Vaccine developed, tested, manufactured, approved, and distributed at the earliest end of 2020 or by late 2021&lt;br&gt;• All steps occur with no major setbacks or deadly side effects</td>
<td>• Safe and effective vaccine and/or effective therapeutics fully available around 2025; in the interim, releasing vaccines that show efficacy while continuing research on impacts, side effects, etc.</td>
<td>• Safe and effective vaccine and/or effective therapeutics after 2025</td>
<td>• Efficacy and logistics related to storage, distribution, and availability of vaccines remain&lt;br&gt;• U.S. began COVID-19 vaccinations on December 14, 2020 for select members of the population&lt;br&gt;• WHO projects that vaccine will not be widely available until mid-2021&lt;br&gt;• Pandemic mitigation strategies such as wearing face coverings, social distancing, and washing hands will need to continue at least for the next 6-12 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public Interactions and Service Delivery</strong></td>
<td>• Face-to-Face interactions resume for all City services and public meetings at the earliest end of 2020 or by late 2021</td>
<td>• Hybrid approach to servicing the public is continued via heavy reliance on virtual options and in-person interactions limited and in compliance with social distancing directives through at least mid-year 2021</td>
<td>• Face-to-Face interactions do not resume at all through 2021</td>
<td>• Virtual interactions, touchless commerce, teleworking, etc. will be a continued necessity for maintaining City operations with minimal to no interruptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Information Technology</strong></td>
<td>• No cyberattacks occur&lt;br&gt;• All employees have necessary resources for working remotely&lt;br&gt;• The City has servers and technology infrastructure to handle increased capacity with no issues&lt;br&gt;• IT department has staff capacity to manage increased reliance on IT or graphics services</td>
<td>• City IT systems can thwart some cyberattacks but still may be vulnerable to others attacks&lt;br&gt;• While most employees have resources to work from home, others still need IT related equipment and support (e.g. computers, faster VPN, etc.)&lt;br&gt;• The City’s servers and IT infrastructure needs upgrades to handle increased volume&lt;br&gt;• IT department staff is managing, but approaching, its capacity for addressing City IT and graphic services needs with existing resources</td>
<td>• City IT systems are not prepared to handle any cyberattacks, is attacked, and the City suffers significant financial and reputational damage&lt;br&gt;• A large majority of the workforce does not have necessary resources for working remotely&lt;br&gt;• The City’s servers and IT infrastructure do not have the capacity to handle increased use&lt;br&gt;• IT department does not have appropriate resources for addressing City IT needs</td>
<td>• Cybersecurity remains a continued area of focus&lt;br&gt;• Employees will need appropriate resources for continued teleworking arrangements&lt;br&gt;• IT will need to continue assessing technology infrastructure needs and plan accordingly&lt;br&gt;• IT will need to continue assessing staff capacity and plan accordingly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>Optimistic</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Pessimistic</td>
<td>Observations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Workforce</strong></td>
<td>• Employees remain healthy with absences trending towards typical annual leave and non-COVID-19 leave, with COVID-19 cases remaining small</td>
<td>• More employees become unavailable due to COVID-19 illness, exposure, caretaking, or the need for a mental health break</td>
<td>• A large portion of the workforce becomes unavailable due to COVID-19 illness, exposure, caretaking, or the need for a mental health break</td>
<td>• For relevant positions, teleworking continues to minimize COVID-19 exposure or provides mechanism for those quarantining to continue work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• All City services continue without interruption</td>
<td>• City services experience some delays or minimal interruptions but City departments manage absences with existing staff or other measures</td>
<td>• City services severely interrupted without replacement or substitute staffing</td>
<td>• Planning around workforce availability, staffing rotations and staggering, etc. remain necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public Behavior</strong></td>
<td>• No psychological biases exist</td>
<td>• The public is generally receptive to COVID-19 safety and mitigation efforts</td>
<td>• A majority of the public is dismissive and noncompliant with COVID-19 safety and mitigation efforts for a variety of reasons</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• All directives and messaging regarding COVID-19 safety and mitigation is well-received</td>
<td>• However, there are people who ignore directives for various reasons, endangering public safety o Normalcy Bias o Attentional Bias o Discounting o Other Reasons</td>
<td></td>
<td>• That includes continuing to offer City services in a virtual environment or via in-person appointments when necessary and with adherence to COVID-19 mitigation directives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fraud</strong></td>
<td>• All employees adhere to City protocols related to contracting, purchasing, time entry, etc. and do not use City resources for personal use</td>
<td>• Employees generally follow City protocols</td>
<td>• Employee improper activity is pervasive amongst City employees and management.</td>
<td>• Departments should continue to implement, evaluate, and revise as necessary, City policy and procedures related to contracting, purchasing, teleworking, time entry, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• However, there are employees who engage in improper activity, taking advantage of weaknesses in internal controls</td>
<td></td>
<td>• City employees should report suspected improper activity to the Office of the City Auditor via the Trust and Innovation Portal (TIP) Hotline ▪ Can be confidential ▪ Email: <a href="mailto:TIP@beverlyhills.org">TIP@beverlyhills.org</a> ▪ Phone: 310-288-2TIP ▪ Website: <a href="http://www.beverlyhills.org/TIP">www.beverlyhills.org/TIP</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix III: Respondents’ Ideas for Innovation

This appendix highlights respondents’ ideas for using data and technology to improve City operations and customer service-delivery. We should note that some themes, such as: 1) the use of Microsoft Teams or similar software for productivity and collaboration; and 2) using online, app based, and/or cloud-based environments and paperless systems for completing financial transactions and administrative paperwork, were recurrent in the survey comments. Also, respondents suggested training (including cross-training and training in productivity and online based software) as well. The survey questions were:

- **Question 18:**
  When thinking about the future of Beverly Hills, idealistically, how could the use of data and technology improve your ability to do your job and improve customer service-delivery? (Please provide specific examples if you have any)

- **Question 19:**
  Assuming resources were plentiful, and the organizational culture was supportive, do you have any innovative ideas you would seek to explore/pilot/implement in your department to improve operations and customer service-delivery?

### Respondent Ideas for Improving City Operations and Customer Service-Delivery

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Automation</th>
<th>Cloud &amp; Secure Information</th>
<th>Collaboration and Productivity</th>
<th>Customer Friendly Information and Transparency</th>
<th>MUNIS System Review and Upgrades</th>
<th>Permits</th>
<th>Recruitment</th>
<th>Retention</th>
<th>Touchless Commerce</th>
<th>Virtual Environment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interviewing Process</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continue offering remote testing (online) and interviewing opportunities</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Creates more flexible recruitment experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Experiencing better attendance and punctuality from candidates during remote interviewing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Allows testing of a larger number of people with a quicker turnaround time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Losing fewer candidates since non-local candidates and those who typically cannot miss work can test on their own time (e.g. during evening hours)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automation</td>
<td>Cloud &amp; Secure Information</td>
<td>Collaboration and Productivity</td>
<td>Customer Friendly Information and Transparency</td>
<td>MUNIS System Review and Upgrades</td>
<td>Permits</td>
<td>Recruitment</td>
<td>Retention</td>
<td>Touchless Commerce</td>
<td>Virtual Environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of Microsoft Teams or Similar Platforms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Invest in Microsoft Teams or other collaborative platforms</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Investing (e.g. purchasing full license) would:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Allow employees to make calls from Microsoft Teams account</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Multiple respondents expressed concerns about personal cell phone use while teleworking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Boost productivity by creating capacity for multiple staff to edit documents in One Drive simultaneously (e.g. Google Docs)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Fully utilize Microsoft tools such as One Drive, Teams, etc. and leverage needed tools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permitting System</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Add City demographics and statistics and/or add existing/available data to parcel data in the City’s permitting system – City Smart</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o According to survey feedback, mistakes observed in City Smart</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ The system could be improved by making data more reliable and creating flexibility with the types of data that can be input</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Adding data could improve customer service by making information available to customers and cutting down on delivery time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improvements needed for inefficient and troublesome permitting and plan review programs</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Implement a more user-and customer-friendly Electronic Plan Review and Permitting system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>▪ Current system requires staff training on troubleshooting and requires extensive support for customers to use the system</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Provide customers access to city records and permit documents online to conduct their own research</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o Would reduce inquiries to City staff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An example would be the ZIMAS system implemented by the City of Los Angeles[^1]
- System provides property and permit info to customers on every property
- Tools provide better customer service and saves staff time

### 411 Customer Line
- Create dedicated 4-1-1 customer service line
- Have a 411 type of customer service line for the whole City
  - Envisioned Process
    - Customer Service Representatives (or dedicated concierge) would answer all incoming calls
    - They would be trained to answer most general questions and provide direct answers to most of the requests & inquiries
    - Only specific concerns/request transferred to department/staff direct extensions
  - Potentially more efficient and may provide better customer service to the community
    - Residents have trouble navigating website and identifying correct extensions for their requests
    - Callers get frustrated when told they called the wrong number and need to be routed to another line
- Shorten auto machine narratives for City Hall (existing messages)

[^1]: We did not conduct any follow-up research on the ZIMAS system.
### Online Platforms and ERP Modules

- Stay current on construction software platforms such as Building Information Modelling (BIM)\(^2\)
- Eliminate standalone modules that are not part of the citywide ERP system and invest efforts and resources to expand existing system
  - Example:
    - Allow inventory modules to be linked to purchasing and accounts payable, timekeeping systems with payroll, and capital assets with CIP project ledger
    - Have inventory modules feed into work order system using GIS tracks, tracks/reports repair needs, job status, and that post results to public
- Create more online platforms for applications, forms, permits and other needs which could be more user-friendly for the community
  - Including smartphone applications that provide GIS/zoning information and access to City’s permitting system
  - Including chat services to connect to library patrons at the time they need assistance
- Fully digitize records
  - Including historical collection materials (books and newspapers)

### Data Dashboards

- Include City demographics and statistics in a dashboard
  - Data is often requested by Commissions and the City Council to assist in decision-making on existing/new regulations
  - Data should be more readily available to city residents/staff/decision makers, perhaps collected and distributed by the city
  - Data can illustrate the volume and nature of calls received from residents and be used to analyze the trends among what our residents want/need

---

\(^2\) We did not conduct any follow-up research on construction software platforms.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Automation</th>
<th>Cloud &amp; Secure Information</th>
<th>Collaboration and Productivity</th>
<th>Customer Friendly Information and Transparency</th>
<th>MUNIS System Review and Upgrades</th>
<th>Permits</th>
<th>Recruitment</th>
<th>Retention</th>
<th>Touchless Commerce</th>
<th>Virtual Environment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • City started an Open Data initiative a couple of years ago  
  o Would like to see it gain more traction  
  o Also, identifying who holds what data and where can make the City more transparent internally and externally | | | | | | | | | |
| **Payment Options and Customer Transactions** | | | | | | | | | |
| • Fully eliminate paper: first EE paper checks, manual printed pay advices, transition all payments to online platforms, or at least payment kiosk that will eliminate the need for cashiers and parking attendants  
• Streamline payment of invoices for vendors, consultants, and contractors  
• Use of touchless technology and mobile apps to transact city services would be an improvement  
• Elderly customers could make a phone call to pay their bills instead of coming into the city | X | X | X | | | | | | |
| **Public Participation** | | | | | | | | | |
| • Continue virtual element of City Hall meetings  
  o Allows people to attend even if they cannot come to City Hall and wait for their item(s) to be heard | | | | | | | | | X |
| **Automation** | | | | | | | | | |
| • Automate services  
  o If task involves paper or computer and is repetitive, can probably automate in part or in whole  
  o If task does not provide all necessary information up-front  
    ▪ Example:  
      • Dog park registration does not record addresses for non-residents  
      • Requires staff to email registrants for their address prior to mailing them key fobs | X | | X | | | | | |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Automation</th>
<th>Cloud &amp; Secure Information</th>
<th>Collaboration and Productivity</th>
<th>Customer Friendly Information and Transparency</th>
<th>MUNIS System Review and Upgrades</th>
<th>Permits</th>
<th>Recruitment</th>
<th>Retention</th>
<th>Touchless Commerce</th>
<th>Virtual Environment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Use of Live Video for Inspections  
  o Deployment of cameras at jobsites or live stream handheld cameras could greatly improve our ability to telecommute  
  o Live video can help the interaction with the Public Works inspectors and contractors to solve project issues or problems | X | X | | X | | | | | | |
| - Contract out a team to respond to and write 5150 holds for psychiatric emergencies  
  o Currently police write the holds which takes the patrol out of service for too many hours  
  o Hold also require training | | | | | X | | | | | |
| - Link COVID tracking forms to keycards  
  o Keycards are way to control access and identify who is in City facilities | X | | | | | | | | | |
| - Community Development, Public Works, and IT collaborate to implement digital street signs on parking meters or signposts wherein regulations or announcements could be changed remotely  
  o Would no longer need to post temporary cardboard signs on meters  
  o Communicate temporary parking regulations/announcements can be communicated faster to customers | X | X | | | | | | | | |

Source: OCA generated based on data from the Confidential, Management and Professional, and Municipal Employees Association bargaining units’ survey results.
STAFF REPORT

Meeting Date: January 8, 2021
To: Audit and Finance Committee Liaisons
From: Eduardo Luna, City Auditor
Subject: Update on the Office of the City Auditor Annual Audit Work Plan for FY 2020/21
Attachments: 1. July 7, 2020 Memorandum to Audit and Finance Committee Liaisons

INTRODUCTION

The City Auditor seeks direction from the Audit and Finance Committee Liaisons to proceed with two additional audits related to high-dollar exposure and enforcement activities.

DISCUSSION

On July 7, 2020, we presented potential audits to the Audit and Finance Committee Liaisons for consideration, see Attachment 1. At the meeting, we proposed completing the audit of the Beverly Hills Conference and Visitors Bureau and initiating an audit of the City’s telework program. The Liaisons agreed the best course of action would be to review audits in the following categories:

- **Operational Efficiencies** – reviewing if the City is delivering services in the most cost-efficient manner possible, such as teleworking and zero-based budgeting;

- **High-Dollar Exposure** – reviewing departments, services, programs, projects, etc. with high expenditures and determining if the outcomes are worth the investments; and

- **Enforcement** – reviewing enforcement efforts around City regulations such as code compliance and traffic enforcement.
The City Auditor would like to commence two audits related to high-dollar exposure and enforcement activities. The City Auditor will obtain input from City management of specific programs, contracts, and activities to review.

Eduardo Luna
Approved By
Attachment 1
STAFF REPORT

Meeting Date: July 7, 2020
To: Audit and Finance Committee Liaisons
From: Eduardo Luna, City Auditor
Subject: Annual Audit Work Plan for FY 2020/21
Attachments: 1. FY 2020/21 Audit Suggestions

INTRODUCTION

This item is submitted for the Audit and Finance Committee Liaisons’ consideration of the City Auditor’s proposed audit work plan for FY 2020/21. The audit work plan identifies proposed audits for the upcoming fiscal year. It is anticipated that all audit work will be performed in-house. In addition, the work plan identifies the City Auditor’s activity related to the implementation of the Trust & Innovation Portal.

DISCUSSION

Background

On July 16, 2019, the City Council reviewed and concurred with the first Annual Audit Work Plan for the Office of the City Auditor. The work plan identified eight performance audits and activity related to the Trust and Innovation Portal (TIP). During the current fiscal year, my office made progress in completing the work plan. However, due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the subsequent State of Emergency declaration, and redeployment of a Principal Performance Auditor to the Emergency Operations Center, I suspended ongoing audit work in mid-March 2020. Specifically, the following audit projects were temporarily suspended because of COVID-19:

- Management of Real Estate Assets (Report issued June 26, 2020)
- Beverly Hills Conference and Visitors Bureau (Report Writing)
- City Take-Home Vehicles (Not Started)
- Rodeo Drive Committee (Not Started)
We need to make a decision on continuing or dropping audits of City Take-Home Vehicles and the Rodeo Drive Committee.

Potential FY 2020/21 Audits

Given that we are in a prolonged state of emergency, the City will likely have reduced revenues for the next 18 to 24 months, which will impact continued levels of service. In this environment, the City Auditor should be more forward looking, as opposed to auditing programs that operated in previous fiscal years. Many City programs may not operate in the same manner going forward, but rather exist virtually (e.g., online classes, payments and permitting) or possibly cease to exist. Given the uncertainty of the pandemic and its impact to City operations, it is more prudent to propose a six-month audit work plan for FY 2020/21. At mid-fiscal year, we can reassess the situation and propose an updated work plan for the remainder of the fiscal year.

Current Audit Resources

For FY 2020/21, the Office of the City Auditor is fully staffed with two Principal Performance Auditors. As shown below, the Office of the City Auditor has 4,400 available audit hours to conduct performance audits, monitor outside audit engagements, and oversee the Trust & Innovation Portal. I should note that given that my office is fully staffed and the current budget situation, I plan to perform all audit work in-house and not rely on any external auditors or consultants.

FY 2020/21 Annual Audit Work Plan

Given current audit resources and the shifting fiscal and COVID-19 situation, my recommendation is to undertake two to three performance audits for the first half of the fiscal year. Attachment 1 has a list of suggested audits from City Councilmembers and City Management. Below is a list of ongoing activities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Trust &amp; Innovation Portal: Fraud-related complaints</th>
<th>Investigate allegations of potential fraud, waste, and abuse in City operations</th>
<th>Financial, Personal Integrity</th>
<th>Fraud</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Trust &amp; Innovation Portal: Research Suggestions</td>
<td>Research suggestions for improving City government. Non-audit service under Government Auditing Standards</td>
<td>Economy &amp; Efficiency</td>
<td>Other Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Recommendation Follow Up</td>
<td>Verify reported implemented recommendations</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>Other Services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Eduardo Luna
Approved By
Attachment 1
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>New Ways of Doing Business</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Audit Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1) Review of the tools needed for effective teleworking and assess the controls for appropriate oversight of telework operations.  
   a) Number of employees teleworking  
   b) Impact of teleworking on City facility space needs  
   c) Long term benefits of teleworking | All | Economy and Efficiency |
| 2) Survey of residents to assess impacts of COVID-19 pandemic on residents (see attached summary conclusion from resident survey results of Sacramento, CA) | All | Economy |
| 3) Survey employees, businesses and residents for innovative ideas/improvements to city services.  
   a) Examine new and innovative ways of doing business to prepare for future (streamline processes, social distancing, etc.)  
   b) Adopt new ways of doing business and maintaining flexibility (e.g. virtual city hall) | All | Economy and Efficiency |
<p>| 4) Use of non-sworn personnel (e.g., ambassadors or social workers) to deal with homeless. | CS | Economy and Efficiency |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fiscal Impact</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Audit Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 5) Review proposed FY 2020/21 budget and key assumptions  
  i) Examine use of consultants | All | Fiscal |
| 6) Undertake zero-based budget reviews of department budgets to identify opportunities for cost cutting. | All | Fiscal |
| 7) Review of existing City services that can be automated, such as cell phone reimbursement process, time and cost versus flat fee payments. | All | Fiscal |
| 8) Audit of replacement and maintenance schedule for various programs.  
  a. Technology/equipment, and licensing costs.  
  b. Vehicles,  
  c. Other equipment | All | Fiscal |
| 9) Audit of the Police Department staffing and scheduling.  
  a. Review growth of department budget over the last four fiscal years. | Police | Fiscal |
<p>| 10) Do all of our financial transactions have appropriate safeguards? Signature authority, two person oversight etc. | Finance | Economy and Efficiency |
| 11) Accounts Receivable: Are we current on all money owed us? Both from individuals and governmental agencies. | Finance | Fiscal |
| 12) Sole source procurement: To what extent do departments rely on sole source procurement? Do we pay an appropriate price? | Finance | Fiscal |
| 13) Citywide overtime: Examination of management rights vs MOU rules. Citywide review of accrual use (related to overtime use for public safety) | All | Fiscal |
| 14) Review of Procurement Card Program | All | Fiscal |
| 15) Audit related party agreements, while some have operating agreements, the overall arrangements may not be fully documented (e.g. expectations re: purchasing rules, use of City facilities, etc.) | Other | Compliance |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COVID-19 Response and Protests</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Audit Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16) Compliance auditing of FEMA reimbursement/cost recovery.</td>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>Fiscal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17) Audit of police use of force policies</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18) Anti-bias police training</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19) Were procurement processes followed when sourcing PPE and other equipment/materials for the COVID-19 response? For example, did the City purchase items from approved vendors? Did the City pay competitive prices for items purchased?</td>
<td>All</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other Governmental Processes</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Audit Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20) Has the Metro process be done according to the rules we set? How many violations? How many repeat? How often are they shut down? Did we get all the money we should?</td>
<td>Public Works</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21) Restaurant streamlining planning process. How is it going? What percentage are within 70 days?</td>
<td>CS</td>
<td>Economy and Efficiency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>