PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
November 10, 2021
8:00 AM

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER
Date/Time: November 10, 2021 / 8:01 AM

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL
Commissioners Present: Commissioners Nazarian, Nystrom, Greer, Vice Chair Millan, Chair Alpert
Commissioners Absent: None
Staff Present: James Burnley, Vince Damasse, Josette Descalzo, Samer Elayyan, Shana Epstein, Debby Figoni, Ilene Knebel, Mandana Motahari, Derek Nguyen, Ken Pfalzgraf, Rob Welch

Commissioner Greer left the meeting at 8:25 AM.
Commissioner Greer returned to the meeting at 9:41 AM

COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE AUDIENCE
Public Speakers: Public comment was heard from David Gingold.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA
By Order of the Chair, the agenda was approved as modified. TAB 3 will be taken later in the meeting due to a scheduling conflict with a Commissioner.

Motion: MOVED by Chair Alpert, SECONDED by Commissioner Greer to approve the Agenda as modified.

AYES: Commissioners Nazarian, Nystrom, Greer, Vice Chair Millan, Chair Alpert
ABSTAIN: None
NOES: None
CARRIED

CONSENT CALENDAR

Motion: MOVED by Vice Chair Milan, SECONDED by Commissioner Nazarian, to adopt the minutes as amended (5/0).

AYES: Commissioners Nazarian, Nystrom, Greer, Vice Chair Millan, Chair Alpert
ABSTAIN: None
NOES: None
CARRIED

2. A Resolution of the Public Works Commission of the City of Beverly Hills Continuing to Authorize Public Meetings to Be Held via Teleconferencing Pursuant to Government Code Section 54953(E) and Findings and Determinations Regarding the Same

Motion: MOVED by Vice Chair Milan, SECONDED by Commissioner Greer to accept the Resolution as presented.

AYES: Commissioners Nazarian, Nystrom, Greer, Vice Chair Millan, Chair Alpert

ABSTAIN: None
NOES: None
CARRIED

REPORTS FROM PRIORITY AGENCIES
Operations Reports from City Departments, Consultants and Outside Agencies
Dr. Pressman gave an update on the current status of the California drought and water supply. The Commission had comments and feedback.

CONTINUED BUSINESS
3. Urban Forest Management Plan Update (Item taken out of order)
City Arborist Ken Pfalzgraf presented an update to the Commission on the Urban Forest Management Plan and requested Commission input. Dudek Consultant Ryan Allen provided comments. Chair Alpert presented a draft Resolution with recommendations agreed upon by all Commissioners after a lengthy discussion. Resolution PWC-05 has been added to the Public Works Commission Book of Resolutions and the full text of the Resolution is below.

RESOLUTION NO. PWC-05
RESOLUTION OF THE PUBLIC WORKS COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL ADOPT THE DRAFT URBAN FOREST MANAGEMENT PLAN (2021) WITH CERTAIN MODIFICATIONS

Whereas, the Public Works Commission has the obligation to provide recommendations to the City Council related to public works infrastructure and programs;
Whereas, the Public Works Commission has reviewed, discussed and invited public comment on the draft Urban Forest Management Plan (2021) presented by Staff and prepared by an outside consultant; and
Whereas, in lieu of a broad endorsement of the draft Urban Forest Management Plan (2021), a complex and detailed document, the Public Works Commission believes it can best implement its obligations to City Council with the recommendations herein.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Public Works Commission of the City of Beverly Hills resolves as follows:
Section 1. The Public Works Commission recommends adoption of the recommendations of the Urban Forest list on pages 64-67 of the draft Urban Forest Management Plan (2021) except for the following recommendations which the Public Works Commission does not support:

- Conduct a health and risk assessment of all palms. Identify which palms are in decline and replace them with shade trees when they require removal.

- Provide funding to establish a city arborist position dedicated to review of private property tree relate issues. To reduce the City’s financial commitment, the position could be a city-approved third-party on-call arborist in lieu of a full-time position.

Section 2. The Public Works Commission recommends adoption of the following additional policies and practices as a basis to enhance the City’s commitment to its urban forest:

**URBAN FOREST STRATEGIC GOAL**  Recommendations:

- TREAT MUNICIPAL TREES AS CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE.

- Recognize climate change may require expedited replacement of certain species of trees and its budgetary impact.

**URBAN FOREST PLANNING CYCLE**  Recommendations:

- The city council should review its urban forest goals on a 3-to-5-year basis.
  - While a long-term urban forest plan offers value, a shorter review time has considerable merit for goal evaluation. Today’s climate assumptions may not be of value in a few years.
  - The Urban Forest Management Plan should be viewed as a living document, updated and revised periodically in response to climate conditions.
Public Works Commission Special Meeting Minutes
November 10, 2021

URBAN FOREST

**CANOPY**

- Strive to achieve and maintain a city-wide canopy cover of 30% or better. On a three-year basis, strive for a canopy increase of 1.5% over current canopy.
- Pursue tree plantings in available open municipally controlled spaces with an emphasis on the southern portion of the city.
- Implement a yearly free tree offering to residents and businesses for planting on their property.
- Include canopy coverage retention and expansion as part of the planning process for new commercial and residential projects.
- Wherever feasible retain monoculture, or at least, a compatible dual-culture of tree species on a block by block, street by street basis.
- Pursue tree species diversity city wide with trees compatible to climate change, drought and local planting conditions.

**VALUE**

- Minimize or avoid replacement, however, of any other species of trees in the city with palms trees going forward.
- Due to the limited canopy of palm trees, consider increase the increasing plantings between palm trees as well encouraging increased vegetation in areas of palm tree plantings.
- Acknowledge that trees interconnect with water use, climate change, air pollution and other environment factors. At the same time, urban trees in Beverly Hills, in particular, promote the city’s brand as well as a unique urban beauty and setting. Trees also equate to an economic benefit to the residents (property values), to the business community (tourism) and to the city (tax revenue). As a result, the city must balance all of these interests must balance.

**DIVERSITY**

- Wherever feasible retain monoculture, or at least, a compatible dual-culture of tree species on a block by block, street by street basis.
- Pursue tree species diversity city wide with trees compatible to climate change, drought and local planting conditions.
Public Works Commission Special Meeting Minutes
November 10, 2021

URBAN WARMING

Recommendations:
- Recognize that trees alone will not alone resolve urban warming or climate change.
- Promote increased, drought tolerant/water efficient, trees and vegetation on city and private property.
- Promote the incorporation of green walls and green roofs in construction.

URBAN FOREST & PRIVATE TREES

Recommendations:
- Minimize the negative effect on the urban forest from private development and infrastructure maintenance
  - Enact ordinances requiring preservation or replacement of existing trees and specifying species for planting; canopy cover for parking lots or pavement materials.
  - Remove fees for tree inspection, removal or permitting related to trees.
- Include canopy coverage retention and expansion as part of the planning process for new commercial and residential projects.

URBAN FOREST & STAKEHOLDERS

Recommendations:
- Offer public guidance and education on private tree plantings including a list of recommended trees to plant and tree maintenance advice.
- Reasonably advise residents and property owners of any intent to replace or remove tress in front of their homes as well as the date for replanting.
- Replacement of city trees should be with larger plantings where practicable and fiscally reasonable.
- Continue to provide a voice for landowners and residents affected by tree removal or replacement.
- Reach out to local environmental, climate and tree advocacy groups affording those groups a voice in ongoing urban forest decisions.

URBAN FOREST INNOVATION

Recommendations:
- Experiment with innovative methods to enhance canopy and tree growth in the city such as the implementation of the Miyawaki (tiny forest) method to create mini urban forests.
- City should investigate grant funding for increasing canopy.
URBAN FOREST ENFORCEMENT

Recommendations:

- Encourage communication to residents of recommended trees to plant.
- Simplify permit process and remove permit fee for residents complying with high-risk tree removal
- Elimination of fees for City Inspections of trees.
- Recommend hiring an additional internal arborist to enforce city tree ordinances.
- Recommend against mandating removal of otherwise healthy trees on private property.
- Support city encouragement of increased, compatible, sustainable tree plantings and vegetation in planning of commercial and residential developments.

Section 3. The Secretary shall certify to the adoption of this Resolution and shall cause this Resolution and certification to be entered in the Book of Resolutions for the Public Works Commission of this City.

Adopted: November 10, 2021

Public Speakers: Public comment was heard from David Gingold.
Public Comment: Public comment was read from Steve Mayer

Motion: MOVED by Chair Alpert, SECONDED by Commissioner Nazarian to adopt Resolution PWC-05 with recommendations to the City Council regarding the Urban Forest Management Plan (5/0).

AYES: Commissioners Nazarian, Nystrom, Greer, Vice Chair Millan, Chair Alpert
ABSTAIN: None
NOES: None
CARRIED

NEW BUSINESS

4. Project Administration Strengths and Opportunities (TAB 4 was taken prior to TAB 3)
City Architect Mandana Motahari gave an overview of the Project Administration Team and projects. Project Administration is responsible for managing, planning design and construction of Capital Improvement Projects related to City Owned Buildings and Parks. This includes 14 parks, 9 civic buildings, 100,000 square feet of community centers and open space amenities, 19 parking structures, and 9 commercial buildings. Projects vary in size and scope with over 50 projects being completed over the last 2 years. She reviewed examples of completed projects. The Commission offered comments and feedback.
5. Demo Garden-Burton Way Median Update
Project Manager Derek Nguyen presented on the Burton Way Median Project, currently in the construction phase. Stormwater regulations were reviewed as well as cost and project details. Water Conservation Administrator Debby Figoni gave a presentation on the educational benefits of the demonstration garden program.

The Commission took a break at 9:49 AM
The Commission returned at 9:59 AM

6. Rates Primer
This item will be presented at the December Commission Meeting due to time constraints.

7. Mandatory Organic Waste Disposal Reduction Ordinance-Draft
Solid Waste Manager James Burnley reported on Senate Bill 1383. The City will be required to adopt an ordinance by January 1, 2022 to insure all residents and businesses comply. An assessment or organic waste for all commercial customers excluding multifamily properties has been conducted. Green bin collection has been expanded as well as labeling of green bins. Public Outreach will be conducted including a QR code that is on the label to be scanned and linked to an SB1383 informational site. Staff requested the support of the Public Works Commission to present this item at a future City Council Meeting.

Motion: MOVED by Commissioner Nystrom, SECONDED by Commissioner Nazarian to recommend the Draft Mandatory Waste Disposal Ordinance (5/0).

AYES: Commissioners Nazarian, Nystrom, Greer, Vice Chair Millan, Chair Alpert

ABSTAIN: None

NOES: None

CARRIED

PROJECT UPDATES & STATUS ITEMS
8. Foothill Water Treatment Plant Update/La Brea Subarea Update
No report.

9. Water Efficiency Update
No report.

10. Capital Projects Update
No report.

11. Specific Information and Department Updates
No report.

COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE COMMISSION
12. Chair's Report
Chair Alpert gave a brief update on the WEP Ad Hoc. Commissioner Nazarian suggested working on Commission efficiency regarding the length of presentations so there is adequate time for discussion, especially on items requiring a vote.
COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF
13. Director's Report
   Director of Public Works Shana Epstein informed the Commission about the Arbor Day Tree Planting taking place on December 3, 2021 at Roxbury Park. A request was made for Commissioners to join the Water Efficiency Ad Hoc Committee to which Chair Alpert and Commissioner Greer were appointed.

ADJOURNMENT
Date/Time: November 10, 2021 / 12:04 PM

PASSED AND APPROVED THIS 10TH DAY of FEBRUARY, 2022

[Signature]
John Miller, Chair