

Appendix D - Review of Past Accomplishments (2014-2021)

A. Housing Production and RHNA Allocation	D-2
B. Housing Program Accomplishments 2014-2021	D-2

The City of Beverly Hills is committed to continually improving programs in the Housing Element to ensure that the housing needs of the community are met. Reviewing past accomplishments is an important step in developing housing strategies that are effective and address identified community needs. State law requires the City to report on progress made in meeting the goals, policies, and objectives set forth in the prior Housing Element. This includes reviewing progress made in implementing programs from the adopted element and evaluating their effectiveness and continued appropriateness for the City. The State also requires the City to report on the housing production during the prior Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) period.

The last Housing Element was adopted in 2013 and covered the 2013-2021 planning period. The following section provides information on housing production since 2013 and an update on the implementation of programs set forth in the prior Housing Element.

A. Housing Production and RHNA Allocation

The City's RHNA allocation for the 2014-2021 planning period was 3 units. During calendar years 2014 through 2020, 208 total housing units were constructed in the City of Beverly Hills.

In the 2013 Housing Element, the City set forth the following quantified objectives for housing production, rehabilitation and conservation (Table B-1).

Table D-1 2014-2021 Summary of Quantified Objectives			
Income Group	New Construction Objective (Actual)	Rehabilitation Objective (Actual)	Conservation Objective (Actual)
Extremely Low	0 (0)	0 (0)	75 (75)
Very Low	15 (16)	100 (56*)	75 (75)
Low	3 (3)	100 (56*)	0 (0)
Moderate	2 (2)	0 (0)	0 (0)
Above Moderate	90 (187)	0 (0)	0 (0)
Total	110 (208)	200 (56)	150 (150)

*56 total (very low + low)

Rehabilitation of the existing housing stock helps preserve the quality of neighborhoods and housing. The City's Handyworker Program (Residential Rehabilitation Program), which provides rehabilitation assistance to low-income tenants and homeowners in the City, was discontinued during the COVID-19 pandemic. Approximately 56 households were served by this program in the last planning period. Implementation measure 9.3 has been revised to urge that the Handyworker program should be re-established by 2025.

The 150-unit Beverly Hills Senior Housing project provides affordable housing to very low-income senior/handicapped residents. The City works with the nonprofit Menorah Housing to ensure the conservation of these units.

B. Housing Program Accomplishments 2014-2021

Table D-2 summarizes additional accomplishments the City has made in achieving housing programs and goals.

A number of the programs in the 2014-2021 Housing Element specifically address housing issues that impact populations with special needs such as elderly populations, female headed households, and those that are or may be experiencing homelessness. These programs specifically include: the home repair

and improvement program, the property maintenance program, the rent stabilization program, the home sharing program, the monitoring affordable housing program, the fair housing program, senior housing development program, and senior case management program.

In the City of Beverly Hills, the senior population is one of the largest special needs populations, and together, these programs aim to provide a holistic approach to maintaining and providing quality housing for this group, and other special needs groups in the City. The Handyworker program helps this cohort of community members remain in their homes and rehabilitate units if needed. The property maintenance program and rent stabilization program helps ensure that living quarters for those living in rent stabilized units (which is a majority of the multi-family units in the City and inhabited by special needs populations including seniors, persons with disabilities, female headed households and large families) are well maintained through landlord and tenant education and enforcement of habitability standards. The rent stabilization program provides legal support for tenants and landlords as well as educational information and consultations to resolve disputes related to tenant/landlord issues and fair housing issues. This program also works with tenants to develop "means and methods" plans to maintain habitability for tenants during construction work to rehabilitate, alter, or repair a structure. The inclusionary housing program, density bonus program, housing trust fund program, senior housing development program and second unit program are all meant to encourage the production of new housing units in the City, which can help senior community members age in place.

The home sharing program and funding for homeless services programs are specifically meant to address the needs of those that are or may be experiencing homelessness. The City employs Community Services staff who specialize in outreach to community members, including special needs populations, to provide information on these resources as well as other resources in the region that may be helpful.

In addition, Community Development staff have been trained to work with eligible parties to process reasonable accommodation requests in order to ensure that the housing needs of persons with disabilities are met.

In summary, the programs included in the housing plan make up a multi-pronged approach to develop and maintain adequate housing for all members of the community, with specific programs to address the specific needs special needs populations that are in the City.

Table D-2: Housing Program Accomplishments 2014-2021

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
Upkeep and Maintenance of Vacated Buildings (No. 9.1)	Preserve existing housing stock	Ongoing	There is proactive enforcement of housing properties, whether vacant or not, if violations exist. Enforcement Officers attempt to gain compliance in order to remedy the situation through outreach and education. Enforcement officers first get contact information, contact property owners to educate them about city codes, if the issue is not resolved, then compliance orders are issued.
Property Maintenance (No. 9.2)	Require housing to be maintained in an aesthetic, safe and habitable manner consistent with City codes	On-going, explore program restructuring by 2016	The City continues to implement the current program and addresses several hundred complaints related to property maintenance each year. In 2020 the City dedicated a code enforcement officer to specifically address habitability issues for the rent stabilization program.
Home Repair and Improvement (No. 9.3)	Provide minor repairs and mobility assistance to approximately 25 low-income households per year	Ongoing	In 2019, the program provided minor home repairs to four single-family homes and five multi-family homes. In 2020, the program provided minor home repairs to one single-family home and one multi-family home. Once the COVID-19 pandemic hit in early 2020, the program was put on hold for the safety of the City's vulnerable residents. The City is currently discussing the future of the program considering the needs of the community.
Historic Preservation Program (No. 9.4)	Evaluate preservation incentives	Ongoing. Evaluate in 2015 and adopt by 2016	In 2014, the City Council adopted an ordinance creating a Historic Incentive Permit that allows owners of historic landmarks to request deviations from development standards when making modifications to their historic properties, provided that the changes do not adversely impact the character-defining features of the historic resource. The City also has a Mills Act program that allows property owners with landmarked properties to seek property tax relief in return for the long-term maintenance and preservation of a historic property.
Condominium Conversions (No. 9.5)	Limit the loss of rental housing by setting an annual cap on condominium conversions and providing tenant protections	Evaluate ordinance revisions and address affordability, and, as appropriate, amend the ordinance in 2016	The City's current ordinance was evaluated in 2011 and the determination was made not to adjust the annual cap at that time.

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
Rent Stabilization Ordinance (No. 9.6)	Continue to implement the rent stabilization program and investigate tenant complaints about unlawful rent increases, service reductions, evictions and relocations	Ongoing	<p>In 2018, the City created a new Rent Stabilization Division within the Community Development Department, for the purpose of administering the Rent Stabilization Ordinance, staffing the Rent Stabilization Commission, and providing other housing services to the community. The major services provided by the Rent Stabilization Division include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Establishing the maximum allowable rent increase 2. Processing rent appeals 3. Assisting landlords with mandatory annual registration 4. Offering referrals for no-cost tenant-landlord legal services (through Bet Tzedek) and mediation services (through the Loyola Center for Conflict Resolution) 5. Conducting multiple workshops and trainings annually to explain landlord and tenant rights and responsibilities under the Rent Stabilization Ordinance 6. Providing dedicated code enforcement staff to investigate habitability complaints <p>Additional housing services conducted by the City include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Operating an aging-in-place group to determined the needs of of vulnerable populations and senior citizens and coordinate service delivery 2. Act as a mediary between tenants and landlords to achieve better housing outcomes and prevent evictions when possible 3. Educating landlords and clients on available funding, such as through the CA COVID-19 rent relief program (i.e. Housing is Key). <p>On March 15, 2020, the City Manager proclaimed the existence of a local emergency in response to the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) epidemic. On March 16, 2020, the City Council adopted an urgency ordinance instituting an eviction moratorium on all residential rental properties in order avoid unnecessary housing displacement, to protect the City's affordable housing stock and to prevent individuals from becoming homeless. The urgency ordinance also provided protections to units subject to the Rent Stabilization Ordinance (RSO) by prohibiting rent increases during the declared local emergency.</p>

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
			<p>In an effort to assist tenants and landlords financially impacted by COVID-19, and to avoid housing displacement and homelessness, the City instituted a Rent Subsidy Program. The City allocated \$1 million for rent subsidy to eligible tenants financially impacted by COVID-19. The City anticipates that it will provide assistance for 333 households.</p> <p>The City completed its third Annual Rent Registration cycle for all multi-family properties subject to the RSO. The Rent Stabilization Division administers approximately 7,700 units of multi-family properties to: promote the stability of renter populations, maintain quality of the City's multi-family housing stock, and protect occupants from unreasonable rent increases while recognizing a housing provider's right to receive a fair return from the rental property.</p> <p>The Rent Registry system was established to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collect data regarding the rental history including amounts paid for rent • Allow owners to register and provide amendments online • Allow tenants to dispute rental amounts online • Improve the reporting requirements and collection of rental data for the City's approximate 7,700 RSO rental units <p>The Rent Registration processes strengthens the mission of the RSO by promoting the stability of renter populations and maintaining the quality of the City's housing stock. The data from the Rent Registry became a vital instrument to communicate the COVID-19 eviction moratorium and restrictions on rent increases.</p> <p>The Rent Stabilization Division also undertook the following activities in 2020:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communicated and informed landlords/tenants of the eviction moratorium and prohibition on rent increases in order to keep both landlords and tenants informed and engaged; • investigated 1,090 RSO cases, including 520 Rent Subsidy cases; • responded to 6,062 inquiries for RSO information; • collaborated with 19 other Rent Stabilization Programs in California to share information and discuss issues related to affordable housing; and • collaborated with the County of Los Angeles in their Rent Relief Program.

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
Monitor Affordable Housing (No. 9.7)	Coordinate with service providers to monitor Section 8 renewals, advise tenants in advance of potential conversion dates, and provide opportunities to continue affordability covenants	Ongoing	The City continues to implement the current program. The City has one very-low income housing building for seniors, which has an affordability covenant and contains 150 units available to very-low income seniors. The City contracts with the Menorah Housing Foundation to oversee and administer the units. In 2018, the City facilitated the rental of two very-low income units located in a Density Bonus project to qualified renters and will continue to monitor these units for compliance. The City continues to monitor these units and facilitate the rental of others. In 2020, the City provided training to the owners of a building with three low-income units anticipated to become available in 2021. The City is also in the process of filling two moderate income units that are currently available.
Density Bonus (No. 10.1)	Encourage the development of more affordable housing units by offering incentives to developers	In 2013 amend the density bonus program to define a list of preferred incentives and concessions	In September 2021, the Planning Commission held discussions on the local inclusionary housing ordinance and discussed the desire to create a local incentive program for the provision of affordable units in housing projects. The Commission directed staff to convey this desire to the City Council to request that the City Council direct the Planning Commission to work on this item as soon as feasible. This item is scheduled to be discussed at the City Council in October 2021.
Inclusionary Housing (No. 10.2)	Require a minimum percentage of units in development to be price-restricted as affordable to lower and moderate income households.	Finish inclusionary housing nexus and in-lieu fee study in 2015 and adopt ordinance in 2016	In 2019, the City Council passed an urgency ordinance to establish interim inclusionary housing requirements. In 2019, the City Council directed staff to complete an inclusionary housing study, which was completed in early 2020. In September 2021 the Planning Commission held discussions on this topic and directed staff to forward an ordinance for a permanent inclusionary housing program to the City Council for approval. The City Council review of the ordinance is scheduled to take place in October 2021.
Housing Trust Fund (No. 10.3)	To be used to construct or help leverage construction of affordable housing	Establish Affordable Housing Trust Fund in Fiscal Year 2014/2015	Through development agreements, the City has negotiated approximately \$4.5 million to be used to establish a housing trust fund. The trust fund has been established and currently holds approximately \$1.5 million.
Second Units (No. 10.4)	Encourage the provision of affordable second units	Evaluate revisions to current second unit standards, and amend the ordinance by 2015; Conduct second unit survey in 2018 to inform the next Housing Element update	A second unit study was conducted in 2010 and the results were discussed in the Housing Element. The City will study changes to the ordinance that could further incentivize the development of second units in upcoming budget cycles. In 2016, the City adopted new second unit regulations (now referred to as accessory dwelling unit regulations) in order to comply with newly passed State legislation that would encourage the provision of such units. The City continues to regularly process permits for accessory dwelling units per State and local regulations. The

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
			<p>City is currently working on updating its accessory dwelling unit regulations in compliance with newly adopted State law.</p> <p>The City received approval for LEAP grant funding to update second unit regulations and is exploring ways to educate the public about the opportunities available. The City anticipates beginning the process of making code updates and outreach on second units in early 2022. The code updates are anticipated to be completed by 2023 and the education on second units will continue throughout the next planning cycle.</p>
Sustainability and Green Building (No. 10.5)	Promote resource efficiency and sustainability in new developments	Ongoing	The City continues to implement the current program in consistency with State law.
Partnerships with Affordable Housing Developers (No. 10.6)	Initiate partnerships with non-profit developers to assist in the development of affordable housing	Participate in conferences, symposiums and other affordable housing events to review resources, incentives, and City goals; Initiate a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) process within two years of the establishment and funding of the Affordable Housing Trust Fund, select a developer and pursue development of an affordable housing project	The City is conducting ongoing conversations with non-profit developers to assist with the potential affordable housing development on a City-owned parcel (s) at 3 rd Street and Foothill Road and/or other City owned properties, including a recently acquired site on Robertson Boulevard. Staff prepared an RFP to identify qualified developers and solicit conceptual proposals, however, the fiscal and operational impacts to the City due to COVID-19 delayed this release. Most recently, in August 2021, a City Council Ad Hoc directed staff to move forward with this project and work to finalize the RFP and further study appropriate City owned sites for housing development.
Fair Housing Program (No. 11.1)	Promote fair housing practices and refer fair housing complaints to Housing Rights Center	Ongoing	The City provides Fair Housing information on the City's website (www.beverlyhills.org). The recently established Rent Stabilization program has developed a number of resources to assist the public with information regarding fair housing. This program has developed the "Tenant and Landlord Rights and Responsibilities Handbook" that is available on the City website (www.beverlyhills.org/bhrent). In addition the staff of this program maintains a website with up to date information on rent relief related to COVID, and current regulations pertaining to renters and tenants. This program is staffed with customer service representatives that are available to answer inquiries from the public. Staff of this program also hold Rent

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
			Stabilization Tenant Legal Training workshops and other workshops for the public and provide videos for these trainings online. The City plans to undertake a more robust effort to promote fair housing practices through the programs included in the 6 th cycle housing element.
Senior Housing Development (No. 11.2)	Provide incentives to facilitate the development of senior housing	Continue to build partnerships with affordable housing developers; Develop a project concept by 2016 and release an RFQ by 2017. By 2018, commence development of a senior housing project in the City affordable to the City's low and extremely low income residents	The City is exploring the possibility of a senior affordable housing project on City-owned land located at 3 rd Street and Foothill Road. There have been discussions between the City and multiple housing providers including, West Hollywood Community Housing Corporation and Related Housing and Menorah Housing Foundation. At this time, the City Council has directed staff to move forward with the creation of an RFP and further study of potential City owned sites upon which to develop potential affordable senior housing. It is expected that the RFP will be released sometime in 2022.
Senior Case Management Program (No. 11.3)	Assist frail elderly residents to remain independent and in their homes	Ongoing	<p>The City continues to implement the Senior Care Management Program and provides additional assistance to seniors through: the Beverly Hills Active Adult Club, exercise classes and activities at La Cienega and Roxbury Parks, and Jewish Family Services which provides a broad range of support services to seniors living independently.</p> <p>The City contributes to a housing/roommate matching program through Affordable Living for the Aging (ALA) to promote independent living for older adults and aging in place. ALA matches seniors in need of housing with local seniors who have an extra room in their residence looking to earn additional income.</p> <p>In FY 2020-2021, the City contributed \$220,000 to a housing and senior legal services program through Bet Tzedek to provide pro bono senior legal services including public benefits, family caregiver services (conservatorships, guardianships, long-term planning and wills, etc.), elder abuse services, foreclosure prevention, and Holocaust survivor services. This program also provides housing legal services to seniors and other low-income individuals in the City providing tenant-landlord legal services (tenancy terminations, lease violations, rent increases etc.), rights and responsibilities under the City's Rent Stabilization Ordinance, and housing conditions and habitability.</p>

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
Senior Home Sharing Program (No. 11.4)	Provide a free shared housing program which matches older people with others interested in sharing their homes	Evaluate Community Assistance Funds and determine grant amount annually	<p>The City contributes to a housing/roommate matching program through Affordable Living for the Aging (ALA) to promote independent living for older adults and aging in place. ALA matches seniors in need of housing with local seniors who have an extra room in their residence looking to earn additional income. In FY 2019-2020, ALA enrolled nine Beverly Hills residents into the program.</p> <p>Due to the Los Angeles County stay-at-home orders restricting the mixing of households, this program was on hold in early 2020. From January until the March closures, the program did complete two Home Share enrollments on the Westside of LA. In that same period, they made nine roommate referrals on the westside, four of which were in Beverly Hills.</p> <p>As of September 2021 the program is no longer on hold and the City continues to refer interested Beverly Hills residents for enrollment in the home sharing program.</p>
Housing Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (No. 11.5)	Develop and adopt written procedures for reasonable accommodation requests and educate the public on the process of requesting an accommodation	In 2014, implement an outreach program in cooperation with the Westside Regional Center to publicize information on available regional resources for housing and services; Pursue State and Federal funds available for supportive housing and services in future affordable housing projects	The City adopted a reasonable accommodation procedure into the zoning code in 2012. When meeting with applicants and/or discussing projects with applicants, City staff is trained to provide information on reasonable accommodation procedures and processes when the request appears to be eligible for such a request. Further, code enforcement staff refer reasonable accommodation enforcement issues to planning staff, who then walk residents through the procedure for gaining approval for already completed work in order to provide a path for accommodations to be continued legally.
Funding for Homeless Services (No. 11.6)	Fund a variety of service organizations that serve the homeless and persons at-risk of homelessness	Annual funding allocations	<p>In FY 2020-21, the City contributed \$106,449 to the CLASP (Changing Lives And Sharing Places) homeless outreach program. CLASP outreaches and engages homeless persons in the City daily with the intention of providing those persons with assistance and support including linking them to shelter.</p> <p>In FY 2020-21, the City contributed \$100,000 for shelter beds at PATH (People Assisting The Homeless). In addition, funds provided to PATH offers access to tenant-based Section 8 vouchers to provide affordable and permanent supportive housing in Los Angeles County.</p>

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
Adjust Development standards (No. 12.1)	Evaluate and modify development standards to encourage more affordable housing units	Amend the Zoning Code in 2013 to include reduced minimum unit sizes as an incentive for the density bonus program; Explore revisions to other development standards, including minimum unit sizes for all multi-family units, as supported by analysis by 2015	<p>Other services funded in FY 2020-21 include: the Westside Food Bank (\$150,000), and Step Up on Second (\$75,000) to assist formerly homeless individuals to remain permanently housed.</p> <p>In 2018, the City began to study the development of a mixed-use ordinance to establish standards for mixed-use residential and commercial development projects. It is anticipated that this study, which continues into 2019 will address needed changes to development standards to further facilitate mixed-use developments where appropriate including minimum unit sizes and parking requirements.</p> <p>In 2020, the City Council passed an ordinance establishing a mixed use overlay zone along many commercial corridors. This will act as a catalyst to revitalize commercial corridors and will allow the conversion of existing commercial buildings to mixed use in areas that previously did not allow residential. Height allowed for these projects ranges from three to five stories depending on where a parcel is located.</p>
Reduced Fees for Affordable Housing (No. 12.2)	Provide waivers or reductions of certain taxes and fees for developments with low, very low, and moderate income housing units	Complete the fee study in Fiscal Year 2014, and adopt modified development fees for affordable housing	To be considered in future budget cycles.
Monitor the Development Review Process (No. 12.3)	Identify inefficiencies and uncertainties in the City's review and promote alternative techniques intended to streamline the process	Adopt updated processing procedures in the Zoning Code in 2013	<p>The City hired an Urban Designer to help streamline review of new housing projects and other developments proposed in the City. Additionally, in an effort to streamline permitting, the Community Development Department was restructured to form a dedicated group of zoning and building code experts tasked with processing development permits.</p> <p>More recently, the City has established virtual counter appointments for the public to have easier access to planning and building and safety staff, a dedicated zoning questions email address, which is fully staffed during work hours to provide answers to housing related zoning questions as quickly as possible. In addition, during the 2014-2021 Planning Period the Community Development Department created a department-wide phone number for inquiries which is</p>

Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
			<p>staffed during work hours in order to assist the public with contacting the correct staff to answer zoning and housing related questions. The goals of these actions are to provide superior customer service to the public, ensure questions are answered in a timely manner, and allow customers to pursue their projects with minimal hindrances.</p> <p>The 2021-2029 Housing Element includes a number of zoning code updates that are also meant to address uncertainties in development process.</p>